

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

Akim-Oda District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue (DLMSD 5)

Minutes



Date: 08th September, 2011

Venue: Akim Oda Municipal Assembly

by Evans Sampene

Members Present

Name

Stakeholders Group

1. James Baidoo	Chainsaw Machine Owner, Otwereso
2. Nana Obiri Yeboah II	Chief, Akim Otwereso
3. Okyere Nyarko	Farmer, Apoli
4. Nana Owusu Aduamaoah III	Chief, Apoli
5. Samuel Gyeabour	Forest Services Division, Akim Oda
6. Attafuah Dacosta	Wood Seller, Akim Oda
7. Benjamin Asuman	Wood Seller, Akim Oda
8. Oduro Asante	Vehicle Owner, Akim Oda
9. Rabiuh Ibrahim	Machine Owner
10. Grace A. Akpozah	Wood Seller, Akim Oda
11. Dzisah Agbenyo	Machine Owner, Akim Oda
12. Francis Amedzrator	MOFA, Akim Oda
13. Kenneth Oduro	GIS, Akim Oda
14. Korankye Daniel	BSM, A Akim Oda
15. Akua Amissah	Aprokumasi Task Force
16. Aikins Ababto	GNFS, Akim Oda
17. Janet Adomah	Wood Seller, Akim Oda
18. Alex Bosompem	Vehicle Owner, Akim Oda
19. Patricia Brago	Wood Seller, Akim Oda
20. Dora Boateng	Wood Seller, Akim Oda
21. Joseph Akomaning	CHRAJ, Akim Oda
22. Samuel Baffour	Forest Service Division, Akim Oda
23. Boady George	Chainsaw Miller, Akim Sweduro
24. Stephen Arkuful	Carpenter, Akim Oda
25. Adwoa Serwaa	Farmer, Otwereso
26. Simeon Akaglah	Forest Services Division, Akim Oda
27. Alfred Vicku	Carrier, Otwereso
28. Faustina Annor	Farmer, Akim Oda
29. Obreampon Sintim Poku III	Traditional Authority, Akim Oda
30. Alex Kwasi Nifa	Chainsaw Operator
31. Yaw Baah	Farmer, Akim Manso
32. Kwasi Tawiah	Carrier, Akim Manso
33. Dora Abankwa	Carrier, Akim Manso
34. Ransford Tawiah	Carrier, Akim Manso

In Attendance

1. Charles Nketiah	Out-going CFW, Akim Oda
2. Vincent Appiah	In-coming CFW, Akim Oda

Project Secretariat

- | | |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. James Parker | NPC, EU CSM Project |
| 2. Evans Sampene Mensah | Research Assistant, TBI Ghana |

Agenda:

The agreed agenda for the meeting were

- Feedback from National MSD5
- Stakeholder consultation on policy proposal for the supply of legal lumber to the domestic market.

Acronyms

AAC	Annual Allowable Cut
BSMA	Birim South Municipal Assembly
CBA	Cost Benefit Analysis
CFW	Community Forestry Worker
CHRAJ	Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice
CSM	Chainsaw Milling
DLMSD	District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
EU	European Union
FC	Forestry Commission
FSD	Forest Services Division
GNFS	Ghana National Fire Service
GIS	Ghana Immigration Service
MOFA	Ministry of Food and Agriculture
MSD	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
MSD-SC	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue-Steering Committee
NPC	National Project Coordinator
SWOT	Strength Weakness Opportunity Threats
TBI	Tropenbos International Ghana
TIDD	Timber Industries Development Division
VPA	Voluntary Partnership Agreement

Proceedings	Actions
<p>1.0 Opening. The meeting started at 10:15 am with a prayer by Samuel Gyeabour a forester at Akim Oda.</p> <p>2.0 Introduction. The DLMSD members introduced themselves stating their names, stakeholder group and destination. The out-going CFW, Mr. Charles Nketia, thanked members for supporting him during his term of office. He informed members he has been transferred to Bechem district in the Brong Ahafo Region. He then introduced the new CFW, Mr. Vincent Appiah, as asked members to give him the necessary support. The NPC thanked the out-going CFW for the good work done.</p> <p>3.0 Welcome addresses. Nana Owusu Aduamoah III, Apoli chief and also a MSD-SC member welcomed stakeholders present and asked them to contribute meaningfully to all discussions at the meeting. He urged members to put aside all personal interests and together find a lasting solution to the illegal CSM menace.</p> <p>The out-going CFW reminded members that one of the objectives of the EU CSM project is to reduce poverty in CSM communities and also secure the supply of legal lumber to the domestic market. He said CSM activities are adversely affecting the forest despite measures implemented by FC. Mr Nketia added that stakeholders have reached consensus on policy option two which, he believes if well implemented, could address the CSM problem, give decent employment to CSM communities and secure legal lumber on the domestic market. He advised members that although the process continues, those involved in illegal CSM should stop because the FSD will continue to enforce the ban on illegal CSM.</p> <p>4.0 Reading and acceptance of the previous minutes. Copies of the previous minutes were distributed to all present Mr. Samuel Gyeabour, a forester with the Akim Oda FSD, read the minutes and translated it to the local language. After some few corrections were made, Mr. Daniel Korankye from BSMA moved for the acceptance of the minutes. He was seconded by Mr. Attafuah Dacosta, a lumber dealer.</p> <p>5.0 Purpose of meeting. The NPC presented the purpose of the meeting as follows.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reporting on National MSD 5 meeting • Consulting DLMSD members on the draft policy proposal aimed at the supply of legal lumber to the domestic market <p>He explained that based on decision taken at the multi-stakeholder consensus meeting in</p>	

Accra in 2010, TIDD and the EU CSM project have developed a draft policy proposal aimed at the supply of legal lumber to the domestic market. According to him, the national MSD 5 meeting discussed the draft policy proposal and recommended that district level stakeholders are consulted to make inputs. and ensure that the strategies in the policy proposal also address the drivers of illegal CSM.

6.0 Feedback from national MSD 5 meeting

The NPC, out-going CFW and an MSD-SC member (Nana Owusu Aduamoah III) presented outcomes of national MSD 5. The NPC's feedback focused on discussions on the draft policy proposal and recommendations made as follows:

- that the strategies in the policy proposal do not adequately address the drivers of illegal CSM. Hence, the need to consult district level stakeholders, and,
- the definition and concept of artisanal milling should be discussed further to include logosols. Also a realistic milling efficiency should be set.

The NPC also informed members that a meeting was held with the parliamentary select committee on forestry issues to discuss the policy proposal. They also made recommendations to improve the proposal.

The out-going CFW and the MSD-SC member also informed members about the action plan for the implementation of the agreed policy option two. They said activities to sensitize stakeholders on policy option two and lobby key stakeholders to buy into the agreed policy option are included in the action plan. They also mentioned that, the CBA favours policy options two and therefore stakeholders are on the right track.

7.0 Group work and presentation of outcomes

Prior to the group work, the NPC reminded members of the drivers of illegal CSM and the outcomes of the SWOT analysis of policy option two (Annex C). He urged members to discuss and develop strategies for addressing the drivers taking into consideration the following:

- dwindling timber resources;
- increased population with corresponding increase in infrastructural developments;
- the domestic aspect of the VPA; and,
- rural unemployment.

Members were put into four groups. Each group discussed a list of drivers of illegal CSM and developed strategies for addressing them. Two groups discussed the same list of drivers, but from different directions. After about one and half hours of discussions, each group presented their results (Details in Annex B). The presentations were followed by questions as well as inputs.

8.0 Closing

The out-going CFW on behalf of the project team thanked members for attending the meeting. The meeting ended at 1:00 pm with a prayer Mr. Samuel Gyeabour.



Signed:
Evans Mensah Sampene
Recorder



Signed:
Charles Nketiah
Chairman

Annex A: Guiding question for group discussions to develop strategies to address drivers of illegal CSM

Question: *In the context of the agreed policy direction (policy option 2), the current situation (forest degradation, population growth and rapid infrastructural developmental in Ghana), develop strategies to address the under listed drivers of illegal CSM in Ghana:*

- Domestic market demand
- Rural unemployment
- Weak institutions
- Inequity in access and benefit sharing (tenure)
- Corruption
- Ambiguity in the law banning CSM
- Easy entry into the trade
- Lack of political will to enforce the ban
- Political interference
- Cross border trade
- Lack of sustained public awareness creation
- Appropriateness of CSM technology in areas where it is not economical for conventional logging
- Lack of proper means for securing protected areas

Annex B: Outcomes of group discussions on strategies for addressing drivers of illegal CSM

1. Domestic market demand

- Develop regulatory framework to ensure that sawmills supply their quota of lumber to the domestic market.
- Reduce export of lumber by sawmills
- Develop artisanal milling concept to supply of legal lumber to the domestic market
- Revise the benefit sharing agreement to serve as incentives for chiefs/land owners to protect naturally germinated timber species
- Enhance capacities of lumber users to use fewer wood volumes
- Laws/policies/rules for accessing trees should be clear with guidelines
- Introduce and promote wood alternatives, examples bamboo, plastics and metals, for building
- Develop and implement aggressive tree planting programmes

2. Rural unemployment

- Develop artisanal milling as viable rural based enterprise
- Promote tree planting as a viable rural enterprise
- Develop and promote viable alternative livelihoods for rural communities
- Build capacities of local people to properly implement alternative livelihood schemes

3. Weak institutions

- Clearly define roles of various security agencies in enforcing artisanal milling laws/policies
- Establish special courts to deal with illegal cases that will arise
- Establish a para-military unit similar to what Wildlife Division has
- Enhance capacity of FSD frontline offices/officers and involved communities in forest protection and monitoring
- Trained prosecutors (FC staff) in forestry law at various districts to prosecute cases
- Develop a system where a quota of revenue generated from the districts can be retained by the districts/frontline offices for operations

4. Inequity in access and benefit sharing (tenure)

- Review current benefit sharing scheme to include the farmer/landowner
- Involved farmers and landowners in decision to sell trees on their land and monitoring.

5. Corruption

- Introduce good conditions of service for security agencies

- Develop clear, simple, understandable laws/policies regulating artisanal milling and sensitize stakeholders on them
- Institute stiffer punishment to offenders

6. Ambiguity in the law banning CSM

- Develop simple, clear and understandable policies/law to regulate artisanal milling

7. Easy entry into the trade

- Develop regulation to guide the artisanal milling concept
- Facilitate establishment of a strong association of artisanal millers and lumber traders

8. Lack of political will to enforce the ban/ Political interference

- Encourage politicians to support artisanal milling concept and the ban on chainsaw milling
- Civil society to name and shaming politicians who will interfere in forest related offenses
- Set up neutral body to deal with complains in the implementation of artisanal milling
- Strengthen institutions concern with implementation of artisanal milling to be able to deal with political pressures

9. Cross border trade

- Ban overland export of artisanal milled lumber
- Develop systems to strictly enforce ban on export of artisanal milled lumber
- Involve security of neighbouring to assist in enforcing the ban.
- Facilitate development of lucrative pricing for artisanal milled lumber

10. Lack of sustained public awareness creation

- Develop and undertake aggressive awareness creation and education involving relevant agencies on the ban on chainsaw milling and the concept of artisanal milling
- Facilitate establishment of forest clubs in schools

11. Appropriateness of CSM technology in areas where it is not economical for conventional logging

- The concept of artisanal milling will address this driver

12. Lack of proper means for securing protected areas

- Build capacity of local people and involve them to secure protected areas
- Strengthen capacity of FSD staff.

Annex C SWOT ANALYSIS OPTION: DOMESTIC LUMBER SUPPLIED BY SAWMILL AND ARTISANAL MILLS ONLY

Options	Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
<p>2 (Domestic lumber supplied by sawmills and artisanal millers)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Industry in Ghana are currently retooling to check inefficiency ▪ Funds are available under NREG ▪ Collaborative resources Management initiatives in Ghana ▪ Existing institutions to monitor harvesting and enforce laws (FSD, TIDD, Immigration Service etc) ▪ Labour groups and Associations ▪ CFC's and unit committees to support monitoring ▪ Current initiatives that supports sustainable forest management (REDD, VPA) ▪ Access to timber resources ▪ Available labour force , skills logistics and technology ▪ Ability to meet local lumber demand ▪ Availability of market ▪ Capital base available ▪ Availability of forest resources. ▪ Favourable climate conditions. ▪ The blend of manual and technological capacities to produce effective and efficiently. ▪ Will be able to produce higher quality at affordable prices. ▪ Will be able to create more jobs in rural communities. ▪ Will generate revenue to the government. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Community unit committees are not functional. ▪ Resource monitoring agencies are under resourced ▪ National data capturing system is weak. ▪ Difficulty in monitoring the operation of the two parties. ▪ Lack of adequate financial resources for chainsaw millers to acquire new machines ▪ Lack of expertise in the business by chainsaw millers ▪ Ability to pay for cost of improvement ▪ Low capacity in terms of supply ▪ Unskilled labour by chainsaw operators ▪ Obsolete machinery on the part of sawmillers ▪ The blend may lead to corrupt practices. ▪ Most of artisanal millers use human beings to convey lumber to accessible place which is very risky ▪ Internal conflict ▪ Conflict between sawmillers and artisanal millers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Improved efficiency from free hand chainsaw operation to artisanal milling ▪ High Demand (available Market) ▪ Formation of associations (CSM) to enhance monitoring and sustainable forest management ▪ Modern technologies available ▪ Provide secured employment for fringe communities. ▪ Reduction in chainsaw related conflicts and associated risks ▪ Improved community livelihoods ▪ Availability of alternative livelihoods. ▪ Increased revenue to government (tax, stumpage etc) and all stakeholders. ▪ Transform chainsaw operators to artisanal millers. ▪ Access to funding and credit facilities ▪ Reduced illegality in the timber industry ▪ Efficiency and reduction of waste in the system ▪ Satisfy VPA requirement ▪ Plantation development activities ▪ Enhanced Donor support ▪ Competiveness leading to potential reduction in cost of lumber 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Depletion of the timber resource ▪ Loss of jobs by some operators ▪ Poor monitoring of the two parties ▪ Organizing chainsaw operators makes them strong ▪ Lack of political will ▪ Dwindling resource base ▪ Interferences by traditional authorities and farmers ▪ Illegal logging ▪ Potential occurrences of conflicts between the artisanal millers and sawmillers ▪ Potential differences in prices of lumber ▪ Extreme weather conditions affecting the forest and productivity ▪ Potential problems with utility services ▪ Substitution of wood with other non-wood materials ▪ Bush fires ▪ Destruction of farm crops and smaller trees.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There will be relatively low waste in lumber production. ▪ The two groups will be able to produce sustainably than a one group. ▪ Artisanal millers can operate at where saw millers cannot. ▪ Reduction in waste with the use of the logosol and sawmill machines. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Opportunity to involve chainsaw operators in re-forestation programmes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Likely fall in profit margin as a result of oversupply to the market. ▪ High cost of equipment
--	--	--	--	---