

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission Programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

Stakeholder Consultations on Policy Proposal for Supply of Legal Timber for the Domestic Market



*By James Parker, Evans Sampene, Jane Aggrey, John Amonoo & Emmanuel Fosu
Tropenbos International Ghana, P.O. Box UP 982
Kumasi, Ghana
Tel. +2339(0)51 60310*

October 2011

“The content of this publication is the sole responsibility of the author s and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union”

“The opinions expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of Tropenbos International”

Table of Content

Acronyms	2
Acknowledgement	3
Summary	4
1.0 Introduction	5
2.0 Background	5
3.0 Objectives	6
4.0 Methodology	6
4.1 Preparation	6
4.2 Development the strategies	7
4.3 Collation the outcomes	7
5.0 Results	7
5.1 Stakeholders participation	7
5.2 Strategies to address drivers of CSM	8
5.3 Matching strategies with draft policy document	8
6.0 Conclusions and recommendations	9
Annexes	10

Acronyms

AAC	Annual Allowable Cut
ANMA	Assin North Municipal Assembly
CFW	Community Forestry Worker
CSM	Chainsaw milling
EHO	Environmental Health Officer
EU	European Union
FC	Forestry Commission
FORIG	Forestry Research Institute of Ghana
FSD	Forest Services Division
GHC	Ghana Cedi
GTA	Ghana Timber Association
MSD-SC	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue-Steering Committee
MSD	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
NREG	Natural Resource and Environmental Governance
NTFP	Non-Timber Forest Product
SRA	Social Responsibility Agreement
SWOT	Strength Weakness Opportunities Threats
TBI	Tropenbos International Ghana
THLDDA	Twifo Heman Lower Dankyira District Assembly
TIDD	Timber Industries Development Division
TVD	Timber Validation Division
USD	United State Dollar
VPA	Voluntary Partnership Agreement

Acknowledgement

The EU-Chainsaw project is grateful to the technical committee who reviewed the policy document as against the strategies developed by the various stakeholders in the project districts. We are particularly grateful for all the guidance and technical support from the committee.

We are thankful to the community forestry workers in all the project districts for their support and cooperation. Several stakeholders from all the project districts contributed massively to enrich the information contained herein and we are grateful to them.

This work has been one big team effort and we appreciate the commitment and dedication of the field team.

Summary

This consultation was undertaken to expand the involvement of stakeholders especially those at the districts to make input into the draft policy document on supplying legal lumber to the domestic market by TBI and TIDD. In order to effectively involve them, stakeholders were tasked to develop strategies to address the drivers of illegal chainsaw milling (CSM). The strategies were then matched with those in the policy document.

A total of 222 stakeholders from 24 stakeholder groups in the 8 project districts participated in the consultation process. MSD-participants were asked to suggest strategies addressing the drivers of illegal CSM. Although this was done separately, some of the strategies developed were shared by most districts. In matching the strategies with those in the draft policy, it was observed that most of the strategies had been considered in the draft policy proposal. Strategies not covered in the draft policy were those addressing issues of corruption, lack of political will and political interference in enforcing the ban on CSM and weak institutions.

Nine of the strategies that have not been addressed in the draft policy document were considered as issues that have to be addressed administratively by FC and other relevant institutions, while actions have already been initiated by FC to address six of the strategies. Five of the strategies under “corruption and lack of political will to enforce the ban on chainsaw milling and political interference” were re-shaped into two strategies and incorporated into the draft policy document.

Recommendations from the consultations were that the outcomes of process be presented to the MSD for their consideration and endorsement. Also issues on the definition and concept of artisanal milling should be looked at and addressed.

1.0 Introduction

Domestic lumber trade in Ghana has been plagued with a number of challenges since the ban on CSM in 1998. Despite the ban, illegal CSM continues to supply as high as 84% of the lumber used domestically with an estimated annual volume of 497,000 m³ and market value of about GHC 279 million (USD 186 million). It is generally acknowledged that most sawmills prefer to export wood to foreign markets due to the higher prices than selling locally to the lower priced domestic market.

Today, the trade in illegal lumber has become one of the main forest governance issues in Ghana. A range of policies, laws and institutions have evolved to govern and control the processing and trade in illegal lumber, but the practice continues to flourish. This has raised intense public debate at various forums and different levels.

It must be acknowledged that apart from ensuring wood availability for domestic consumption, trade in illegal chainsawn lumber has helped to sustain rural economies and livelihoods. It is estimated that illegal CSM provides jobs for about 97,000 Ghanaians and livelihood support for more than 650,000 people. It has also contributed to the emergence of community enterprises, including carpentry shops, wood villages/markets and charcoal production.

It is evident that so long as there is no alternative for the supply of legal wood to the domestic market, the ban on CSM will remain un-enforceable. Revenue loss, resource destruction and associated conflicts will continue to be a major challenge to the forestry sector. The practice presents obstacles to implementing Ghana's VPA with the EU. A major concern is that measures to regularize the forest industry if based on current policies/laws, will lead to a crackdown on illegal CSM enterprise. This will lead to serious social conflicts.

2.0 Background

In 2007, TBI and its partners initiated a process funded by the EU to bring together all relevant stakeholders on a platform to dialogue on CSM. The aim is to collectively develop a policy direction for supplying legal lumber to the domestic market. Again in 2008, TIDD of the FC under the NREG programme also commissioned a programme to help meet the VPA requirement of supplying legal lumber to the domestic market. From independently commissioned studies, findings from both initiatives proposed similar policy directions as follows:

- Saw millers only to supply legal lumber to the domestic market
- Saw millers and artisanal millers to supply the domestic market with legal lumber
- Artisanal millers only to supply the domestic market with legal lumber

These three proposed policy directions have been discussed by stakeholders at the community, district and national levels since November 2009. In September 2010, stakeholders from the TIDD and TBI chainsaw processes separately reached consensus on a viable policy direction: **Sawmillers and artisanal millers to supply the domestic market with legal timber obtained from sustained yields.** In October 2010, a joint multi-stakeholder meeting between the two processes was held to look at the way forward in operationalizing the agreed policy direction. Stakeholders agreed that the two processes merge and work together to prepare a draft policy document for supply of legal lumber to the domestic market in the context of the agreed policy direction. In June 2011, a draft policy document was presented and discussed at the 5th MSD meeting. One of the major conclusions by stakeholders was that the draft policy document did not well address the drivers of illegal CSM. Stakeholders therefore, agreed that further consultations be done at the district level to make inputs to the draft policy document.

3.0 Objectives of the stakeholder consultation

The stakeholder consultations were carried out to:

- develop strategies to address the drivers of illegal CSM in the context of the agreed policy direction;
- match the strategies with that in the draft policy document to identify gaps, and,
- propose strategies to address the gaps identified

4.0 Methodology

To get the consultation well carried out, the project team employed the following methodology:

4.1 Preparation

Documents on recommendations for controlling illegal CSM in Ghana, and strategies for addressing weakness and threats of policy option 2 were studied. In addition, the Ghana case study report on CSM and cost-benefit analysis report on the proposed policy directions were also studied. From these documents, background and summary on prevailing conditions/context

and drivers for illegal CSM were prepared. Guiding questions (annex 2) for developing strategies for addressing drivers CSM were also prepared.

4.2 Developing the strategies

In each district, (Goaso, Sunyani, Nkawie, Juaso, Begoro, Kade, Akim Oda and Assin Foso) an MSD meeting was organized. The purpose of the meeting was presented followed by updates of the MSD process and the project. The drivers of CSM and prevailing conditions such as increase in human population and dwindling timber resources were explained to stakeholders. Reference materials including recommendations for controlling illegal CSM in Ghana, summary of cost-benefit analysis report on the proposed policy directions and results of the SWOT analysis of option two were given to stakeholders.

After the presentations, stakeholders were put into four groups to discuss and develop strategies for addressing the drivers of CSM. The group discussions were facilitated by the CFWs, project staff and the MSD-SC members. Two groups discussed and developed strategies for the same list of drivers, but from different ends of the list. After 2 hours of discussions, each group made a presentation on their outcomes and was followed by questions for explanation and clarification.

4.3 Collating the outcomes

The strategies developed at the district were collated and organized under their respective drivers. These strategies were then matched with those in the draft policy document to identify gaps and areas for improvement. An MSD technical committee meeting was organized to discuss the outcomes of the consultation process and also propose strategies to address gaps identified.

5.0 Results

5.1 Stakeholder Participation

Eight project districts were visited and district level MSDs organized. A total of 222 stakeholders from 24 stakeholder groups participated in the consultation (annex 1). The new project districts (Nkwanta and Tarkwa) were not included in the consultation because they are new to the MSD process.

5.2 Strategies to address drivers of CSM

A total of 72 strategies (annex 3) for addressing the drivers of illegal CSM were developed by stakeholders. Some of the strategies were shared by most districts while others were not. Strategies to address cross border trade were conflicting. While some stakeholders were of the view that cross border trade should be banned outright, others thought that would be difficult, but a strategy to develop a specialized market for it will address that. It was agreed in all the districts that formalising artisanal milling will address the driver on the appropriateness of CSM technology in areas where conventional logging is not ideal. Stakeholders noted that it will be difficult to implement strategies to address lack of political will and interference in enforcing the ban on chainsaw milling. They also noted that the acceptance and successful implementation of all the strategies depends on the politicians providing their support.

5.3 Matching strategies with draft policy document

Most (63.8%) of the strategies developed have been adequately covered by the draft policy (annex 3). Most of the strategies not included in the draft policy document are those addressing drivers like corruption, weak institutions and lack of political will and interference in enforcing the ban.

At the MSD Technical Committee Meeting, the FC representative revealed that there are initiatives (annex 4) to implement some of the strategies not covered in the draft policy document. These initiatives included: military training of selected FSD staff (creating a paramilitary section for the FSD); training FSD staff to persecute offenses; encouraging communities to establish dedicated forests; and tasking FORIG to look at the AAC. The Technical Committee agreed that some strategies not covered in the draft policy document or FC's initiatives were administrative issues and the attention of relevant institutions/sectors should be drawn to them.

On the issue of cross border trade, the technical committee concluded that since the concept of artisanal milling is to supply lumber to the domestic market, a strategy to set up a specialized market for cross border trade will defeat the concept. Cross border trade of artisanal milled lumber should be banned; traders should be linked to sawmills. One strategy "facilitate development of legal instrument to protect forestry officials and other security agencies to enforce the laws/policies" was considered as one that cannot be looked at under the project. Strategies under corruption and lack of political will and political interference in enforcing the

ban were re-phrased into two strategies (“improve sector governance to address corruption” and “encourage civil society to provide platforms for politicians (political parties) to outline their forest management policies during campaigns”) (annex 4).

6.0 Conclusions and Recommendations

Stakeholders effectively participated in the consultation process and developed good strategies to address the drivers of illegal CSM. Strategies not covered in the draft policy document were included.

The technical committee recommended that the outcomes of the consultation process and the technical committee meeting should be presented to the MSD at the national level for their consideration and endorsement. It was also recommended that issues concerning the definition and concept of artisanal milling should be looked into and addressed.

Annex 1. List of stakeholders

DISTRICT	NAME	STAKEHOLDERS GROUPS
KADE	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. K. Gyemah 2. Asare Kwaku 3. J.B. Antwi 4. Shibu Hamidu 5. Alhaji Awal 6. Agyei Otu Samuel 7. Emmanuel Ayensu 8. Kofi Gamerah 9. Isaac Birikorang 10. Yaw Nkrumah 11. Yaw Agyei 12. Isaac Anobah 13. Josephe Hena 14. Kobbina Robbert 15. Samuel Kwarteng 16. Samuel Nakum 17. Frimpong Richard 18. Isaac ofori 19. Frank Osafo 20. Ebenezer Kwame 21. Ben Laryea 22. Yaw Frimpong 23. Konneh Williams 24. Emmanuel Brefo 25. Emmanuel Nator 26. Kingsely Asamoah 27. Addae Owusu 28. Raymond Ayepah 	<p>Machine Owner Machine Owner Machine Owner Machine Owner Machine Owner Ghana Fire Service Stool Lands Forest Services Division Chainsaw Operator Apprentice Machine Owner Lumber Dealer Chainsaw Operator Forest Services Division EcoTech Chainsaw Operator Chainsaw Operator Farmer Machine Owner Machine Owner Chainsaw Operator Machine Owner Ghana Police Service Community Forestry Committee Chainsaw Operator Chainsaw Operator Chainsaw Operator Community Forestry Worker, Akyem Kade</p>
AKYEM ODA	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. James Baidoo 2. Nana Obiri Yeboah II 3. Okyere Nyarko 4. Nana Owusu Aduamaoah III 5. Samuel Gyeabour 6. Attafuah Dacosta 7. Benjamin Asuman 8. Oduro Asante 9. Rabiuh Ibrahim 10. Grace A. Akpozah 11. Dzisah Agbenyo 12. Francis Amedzrator 13. Kenneth Oduro 14. Korankye Daniel 15. Akua Amissah 16. Aikins Ababto 17. Janet Adomah 	<p>Chainsaw Machine Owner Chief Akim Otwereso Farmer Chief Apoli Forest Services Division Wood Seller Wood Seller Vehicle Owner Machine Owner Wood Seller Machine Owner Ministry of Food and Agricultural Ghana Immigration Service Birim South Minicipal Assembly Aprokumasi Task Force Ghana National Fire Service Wood Seller</p>

	<p>18. Alex Bosompem 19. Patricia Brago 20. Dora Boateng 21. Joseph Akomaning</p> <p>22. Samuel Baffour 23. Boadi George 24. Stephen Arkuful 25. Adwoa Serwaa 26. Simeon Akaglah 27. Alfred Vicku 28. Faustina Annor 29. Obreampon Sintim Poku III 30. Alex Kwasi Nifa 31. Yaw Baah 32. Kwasi Tawiah 33. Dora Abankwa 34. Ransford Tawia 35. Charles Nketiah 36. Vicent Appiah</p>	<p>Vehicle Owner Wood Seller Wood Seller Commission for Human Right and Administrative Justice Forest Services Division Chainsaw Miller Carpenter Farmer Forest Services Division Carrier Farmer Traditional Authority Chainsaw Operator Farmer Lumber Carrier Lumber Carrier Lumber Carrier Community Forestry Worker, Akyem Oda New Community Forestry Worker, Akyem Oda</p>
ASSIN-FOSU	<p>1. Gabriel Amanor 1. Kwabena Badu 2. Kwadwo Afful 3. Bismark Kofi Bonnah 4. George Mintah 5. Asante Kwabena 6. P. K .Dick 7. Kwadwo Acquah 8. Samuel k. Nyame 9. Edwin Fifi Acquah 10. Thomas Jast-To-Way 11. David K. Amoah 12. Kwamina Hayford 13. Rose Bentum 14. S.K. Boafo 15. Daniel Y. Ansah 16. Yade Vincent 17. Peter Yaw Affum 18. Nifaasoyir Chrisantus 19. Simon Sam 20. Ofori Amanfo 21. Munkaila A. Bawah 22. Kofi Nkyi 23. Kweku Seidu 24. Elijah Andorful 25. Nana Kwakye-Andoh 26. Nii Anali Sai 27. Alhaji M.A. Nkansah</p>	<p>Wood Worker Carrier Carrier Operator Operator Forest Services Division Ministry of Food and Agricultural Chainsaw Operator Table Saw Miller Lumber dealer EHO (T.H.L.D.D.A) EHO (A.N.M.A) Ghana Fire Service Assin-North Municipal Assembly Operator/Lumber dealer Lumber dealer Forest Services Division M.D Assin-Fosu Forest Services Division Operator Media Environmental Health and Sanitation Carrier Carrier Operator Traditional Authority Bureau of National Investigation Yaban ventures</p>

	<p>28. Kwame Danquah 29. Michael Sagoe 30. Ekua Ansah-Eshon 31. Joseph Blay 32. I.C.Y. Apetorgbor 33. Seth K.A. Duodu</p>	<p>Operator National Commission on Civic Education National Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue Chairperson Magistrate-Assin- Fosu District Manager-Forest Service Division Community Forestry Workers- Assin-Fosu</p>
BEGORO	<p>1. Emmanuel Bempong 1. Kwame Ofri-Attah 2. Stanley Siame 3. Nana Kyei Boateng 4. Achuli Michael 5. Francis Aseidu 6. Benefo Antwi 7. Ampomah Seth 8. Nartey Kofi 9. Darko William 10. Samuel Doe 11. John Tetteh 12. Eric Adade 13. Kwabena Ayisi 14. Paul Akrasi 15. Ben Opoku Asare</p>	<p>Machine Owner Machine Owner Machine Owner Traditional Authority Ministry of Food and Agricultural Fantekwa District Assembly-Begoro Carpenter Carpenter Machine Machine Owner Forest Services Division Chainsaw Operator Chainsaw Operator Chainsaw Operator District Manager-Forest Services Division Community Forestry Worker-Begoro</p>
NKAWIE	<p>1. Jacob Odame 2. Kwabena Apau 3. Kweku Kyere 4. Kwadjo Nsiah 5. Kofi Acheampong 6. Bernard Bekoe 7. Faustina Adjei 8. Nsiah James 9. Prosper Adeliwini 10. Paul K. Gyesi 11. Tekyi De-Graft 12. Nasimong Solomon 13. Dickson Kusi 14. Nicholas Korley 15. Lord Marfo 16. Manu Joseph 17. Nana Yaw Owusu 18. Mark Manu Aidoo 19. Nana Kweku Tutu II 20. Eric Nyame 21. Jephthan Kwame Sarfo 22. Abu saddick 23. Mavis Akua Serwa</p>	<p>Fire Service, Nyinahin Carpenter, Apenamadi Chainsaw Operator, Apenimedi Carrier, Apenimedi Chainsaw Operator, Apenimedi Ghana News Agency, Nyinahin Ghana Immigration Service, Nkawie National Forest Forum, Nkawie District Assembly, Nkawie Community Forest Committee, Baniekrom Community Forest Committee, Akota Community Forest Committee, Akota Community Forest Committee., Akota District Assembly,Nkawie Lumber Dealer, Abuakwa Farmer, Kyekyewereh Farmer, Kyekyewereh Forest Services Division, Nkawie Traditional Authority, Nyanahin District Assembly, Nyanahin District Assembly, Nkawie Chainsaw Operator, Abuakwa Forest Services Division, Nkawie</p>
JUASO	<p>1. E. K. Torsu 2. S.B. Adams 3. Nana Adontehene</p>	<p>Chainsaw Operator, Obogu Community Forest Committee, Komeso Traditional Authority, Obogu</p>

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. Nana Bansa 5. James Yamoah 6. Stephen Sarkodie 7. Kwesi, George 8. Kweku Ofori 9. Larbi Ebenezer 10. Isaac Asare 11. M.A. Nkansah 12. Yaa Amoakowaa 13. Yaw Preko 14. Benedicta Abeberese 15. Amoh Koranteng 16. Amoako Dankwa 17. Joseph Torsu 18. Ofosu Tawiah 19. Yussif Ibrahim 20. William Agyapong 21. TALENTO 22. Anthony Ahorsu 23. Boadi Agyapong 24. Stephen Opare 25. Kwabena Gyasi 26. Aikins Agyapong 27. Arko Tettey 28. Seth Kusi 29. Owusu Amankwah Solomon 30. Kwame Amponsah 31. Ebenezer Agyakwa 32. Thomas Dovi Kwaku 	<p>Traditional Authority, Bansa Farmer, Bansa Farmer, Juaso Chainsaw Operator, Juaso Judiciary Services, Juaso Community Forest Committee, Dwendwenase Farmer, Obogu Ghana National Fire Service, Konongo Lumber Dealer, Obogu Chainsaw Operator, Obogu Lumber Dealer, Obogu Ministry of Food and Agricultural, Juaso Chainsaw Operator Community Forest Committee, Obogu Chainsaw Operator, Juaso Ghana National Service, Juaso Carpenter, Juaso Timber Contractor, Konogo Sawmiller, Juaso National Disaster Management Organization Carpenter, Obogu Carpenter, Obogu District Assembly, Juaso District Assembly, Juaso Forest Services Division, Juaso KNUST, Kumasi Media, Kumasi Forest Service Division, Juaso</p>
SUNYANI	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Kwesi Anane Yeboah 2. Mercy Yeboah 3. George Tekyi 4. J.K. Tawiah 5. Kofi Yeboah Gyan 6. Chares Kwesi Kumi 7. A. Boakye Akuoku 8. Prince Henneh 9. Stephen Mensah 10. Osei Mensah 11. Jemima Barrida Mawiah 12. Donkor Bossman 13. Anthony Adjei 14. Peter Tekyi 15. Kofi Yeboah Gyan 16. David Yeboah 17. Nana Appiah Bonsu 18. Stephen Afram 19. Michael Mensah 	<p>Chainsaw Operator, Asuakwa GTA, Sunyani Carrier, Asuakwa Farmer, Asuakwa Wood Workers Association, Sunyani National forest Forum, Sunyani Municipal Assembly, Sunyani Farmer, Ayigbe Chainsaw Operator, Atronie Carrier, Atronie Forest Services Division, Sunyani Chainsaw Operator, Atronie Community Forest Committee, Atronie Wood Sellers Association, Sunyani wood Workers Association, Sunyani Wood Sellers Association, Sunyani Traditional Authority, Atronie Chainsaw Operator, Atronie Farmer, Atronie</p>

	<p>20. Nana Yaw Sakyi 21. Nana Akosua Bema 22. Leonard Kumle 23. Isaac Sampson 24. Kwesi Anane Yeboah 25. Francis Mornah 26. Augustina Adoma</p>	<p>Traditional Authority, Asuakwa NTFP Collectors, Asuakwa Traditional Authority, Abrefakrom Farmer Group, Abrefakrom Chainsaw Association, Chiraa Fire Service, Sunyani Traditional Council, Sunyani</p>
GOASO	<p>1. Atta Kwadwo 2. Y.O Tetteh 3. Adjei Augustine 4. Kofi Agyei 5. Akwatia Kwadwo 6. John Atinga Parker 7. Richard Agyenim Boateng 8. Alhaji Halidu 9. Emmanuel Willington 10. Kojo Foli 11. Charles Mensah 12. Akwei Douglas 13. Nicholas Attah 14. Yaw Paul 15. Abraham Mensah 16. Emmanuel Adu 17. Raynolds Brenyah 18. Gladys Amoah 19. Dankwa Martin 20. Atiewin A. Mohammed 21. Eric Yahaya 22. Ahadzi Wisdom 23. Augustine Gyedu 24. Emmanuel Agyapong 25. Linda Mintah 26. Robert Owusu 27. Yaw George 28. Theodore Amuzu 29. Solomon Mensah</p>	<p>Chainsaw Operator Community Forest Committee</p> <p>Carrier, Akrodie Carpenter, Asumura Wildlife, Goaso Chainsaw Operator, Akrodie Sawmiller, Mim Machine Owner, Mim Lumber Dealer, Sankore Chainsaw Operator, Sankore Lumber Dealer, Kukuom Farmer, Kasapee Chainsaw Operator, Gambia Carpenter, Ayomso Chainsaw Operator, Asumura Fire Service, Goaso GTA, Goaso Chainsaw Operator, Akrodie Carpenter, Zoli Carrier, Ayomso Carpenter, Ayomso Forest Services Division, Goaso Forest Services Division, Goaso Forest Services Division, Goaso Farmer, Akrodie Carrier, mim Chainsaw Operator, Sankore Farmer, Mim</p>

Annex 2. Guiding questions for group discussions to develop strategies to address drivers of illegal CSM

Group A1

Question: *In the context of the agreed policy direction (policy option 2), the current situation (forest degradation, population growth and rapid infrastructural developmental in Ghana), develop strategies to address the under listed drivers of illegal CSM in Ghana:*

- i. Domestic market demand
- ii. Rural unemployment
- iii. Weak institutions
- iv. Inequity in access and benefit sharing (tenure)
- v. Corruption
- vi. Ambiguity in the law banning CSM
- vii. Easy entry into the trade

Group B1

Question: *In the context of the agreed policy direction (policy option 2), the current situation (forest degradation, population growth and rapid infrastructural developmental in Ghana), develop strategies to address the under listed drivers of illegal CSM in Ghana:*

- i. Easy entry into the trade
- ii. Ambiguity in the law banning CSM
- iii. Corruption
- iv. Inequity in access and benefit sharing (tenure)
- v. Weak institutions
- vi. Rural unemployment
- vii. Domestic market demand

Group A2

Question: *In the context of the agreed policy direction (policy option 2), the current situation (forest degradation, population growth and rapid infrastructural developmental in Ghana), develop strategies to address the under listed drivers of illegal CSM in Ghana:*

- i. Lack of political will to enforce the ban
- ii. Political interference
- iii. Cross border trade
- iv. Lack of sustained public awareness creation
- v. Appropriateness of CSM technology in areas where it is not economical for conventional logging
- vi. Lack of proper means for securing protected areas

Group B2

Question: *In the context of the agreed policy direction (policy option 2), the current situation (forest degradation, population growth and rapid infrastructural developmental in Ghana), develop strategies to address the under listed drivers of illegal CSM in Ghana:*

- i. Lack of proper means for securing protected area
- ii. Appropriateness of CSM technology in areas where it is not economical for conventional logging
- iii. Lack of sustained public awareness creation
- iv. Cross border trade
- v. Political interference
- vi. Lack of political will to enforce the ban

Annex 3. Strategies developed by districts stakeholders compared with policy document.

DRIVERS OF CSM	STRATEGIES	COMPARISM WITH		WEIGHT (IMPORTANCE)
		POLICY ADDRESS	DOCUMENT NOT ADDRESS	
Domestic market demand	i. Develop aggressive tree planting process to sustain the timber resources. Important tree species and GSBAAs should be strictly protected.	4.3.1 (x)		8 (Kade, Begoro, Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Develop regulatory framework and provide incentives to ensure that sawmills supply their quota of lumber to the domestic market.	4.3.1 (i)		7 (Begoro, Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iii. Develop and promote artisanal milling models/concepts targeting chainsaw operators to supply legal lumber to the domestic market.	4.3.1 (iv) 4.3.5 (ii)		6 (Kade, Assin Foso, Oda, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iv. Facilitate formation of small holder artisanal milling cooperative groups/associations, build capacity, certified and assist them to acquire equipments to mill and supply lumber to the domestic market	4.3.4 (i) 4.3.4 (v)		4 (Kade, Begoro, Goaso, Juaso)
	v. Reduce export of lumber	4.3.1 (i)		3 (Assin Fso,Oda, Juaso)
	vi. Introduce and promote wood alternatives examples bamboo, plastics and metals for building	4.3.1 (viii)		3 (Oda, Assin Foso, Sunyani)
	vii. Create lumber depots in the district capitals as well as strategic communities for easy access to lumber.	4.3.1 (vii)		3 (Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie)
	viii. Link artisanal millers to the conventional miller to use their logging residues	4.3.1 (v)		2 (Goaso, Sunyani)
	ix. Import logs for processing	4.3.1 (1x)		2 (Nkawie, Sunyani)

	x. Laws/policies/rules for accessing trees should be clear with guidelines	4.3.1 (v)		2 (Oda, Goaso)
	xi. Strengthen laws banning CSM and use of chainsawn lumber	4.3.2 (iv)		2 (Kade, Nkawie)
	xii. Review AAC and adhere to it under the artisanal milling concept*		✓	1 (Kade)
	xiii. Enhance capacities of user of lumber to use fewer volumes	4.3.1 (vi) 4.3.4 (i)		1(Oda)
	xiv. A law should be made compelling artisanal millers to sell their products to the domestic market only	Definition-artisanal milling		1 (Assin Foso)
13 out of the 14 strategies are addressed in the policy document (93%)				
Rural unemployment	i. Develop viable rural based alternative livelihoods in crop farming, livestock rearing, fish farming and poultry and non traditional farming like mushroom farming, snail rearing and bee-keeping.	4.3.4 (vi) 4.3.5 (i)		7 (Kade, Begoro, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Develop plantation activity as a viable forest based enterprise for rural people and encourage landowners/traditional authorities to release lands for tree planting programme.	4.3.4 (vi) 4.3.5 (i)		7 (Kade, Assin Fosso, Begoro, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Sunyani)
	iii. Build capacity of rural people to be able to undertake viable alternative livelihoods.	4.3.4 (vi) 4.3.5 (i)		6 (Kade, Assin Foso, Oda, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iv. Develop artisanal milling as viable rural based enterprise	4.3.5 (ii)		5 (Kade, Begoro, Oda, Juaso, Nkawie)
	v. Encourage timber Companies to employ workers (especially unskilled labour) from rural communities where they are sited.		✓	2 (Goaso, Nkawie)
	vi. Provide incentives/setup support for adoptions of developed alternative livelihoods	4.3.5 (i) 4.3.5 (iii)		1 (Goaso)
5 out the 6 strategies are addressed in the policy document (83%)				
Weak institutions	i. Enhance the capacity of the FC and other institutions (including CBOs) that would be involved in the implementation of the artisanal milling concept to effectively address challenges that would arise	4.3.2 (v) 4.3.3 (ii)		6 (Kade, Oda, Begoro, Goaso, Juaso,

				Nkawie)
	ii. Encourage stakeholders to assist institutions concern with forest management to enforce the laws/policies concerning artisanal milling	4.3.2 (v) 4.3.3 (ii)		4 (Assin Foso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iii. Develop a system where a quota of revenue generated from the districts can be retained by the districts/frontline offices for operations and ensure effective supervision of staff		✓	3 (Kade, Oda, Goaso)
	iv. Define clearly roles of various institutions concern with forest management		✓	2 (Assin Foso, Oda)
	v. Establish a Para-military unit similar to what Wildlife Division have		✓	1 (Oda)
	vi. Increase the number of district offices (The district offices are too big)		✓	1 (Nkawie)
2 out of the 6 strategies are addressed in the policy document (33%)				
Inequity in access and benefit sharing (tenure)	i. Review current benefit sharing scheme to include the farmer/landowner	4.3.3 (i)		8 (Kade, Assin Foso, Begoro, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Develop a legal and regulatory framework to enable artisanal millers have access to resource and domestic use by landowners	4.3.1 (v)		5 (Assin Foso, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iii. Ensure more transparency and involvement of local people in the process of removing trees by concessioners and payment of benefits	4.3.3 (ii)		5 (Begoro, Goaso, Juaso, Sunyani, Nkawie)
	iv. Create awareness on access and benefit sharing from timber resource and the procedure for harvesting on-farm trees	Crosscutting issue		4 (Kade, Assin Foso, Sunyani, Nkawie)
	v. Ensure that most of the benefits paid to the district assembly and traditional authorities are used for development projects that will benefit communities where the timbers were extracted.	4.3.3 (iii)		1 (Begoro)

All strategies are addressed in the policy document (100%)				
Corruption	i. Strengthen the existing laws on corruption to include stiffer punishment for offenders and reward sincere staff		✓	7 (Kade, Oda, Assin Foso, Begoro, Goaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Develop simple, clear and understandable policies/law to regulate artisanal milling	4.3.1 (iii) Partially		5 (Kade, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Sunyani)
	iii. Provide incentives to local people and involve them in monitoring	4.3.3 (ii)		4 (Assin Foso, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie)
	iv. Sensitize artisanal millers, lumber traders and other stakeholders on the impact of corrupt practices	Crosscutting issue		3 (Begoro, Assin Foso, Nkawie)
	v. Introduce good conditions of service for security agencies		✓	3 (Oda, Goaso, Nkawie)
	vi. Trained prosecutors (FC staff) in forestry law at various districts to prosecute cases and establish special courts to deal illegal cases that will arise		✓	2 (Assin Foso, Oda)
	vii. Train, licence and register artisanal millers	4.3,4 (v) 4.3.2 (i)		1 (Begoro)
	viii. Name a shame corrupt traditional authorities and politicians		✓	1 (Sunyani)
	ix. Ensure speedy prosecution of forestry related cases.		✓	1 (Assin Foso)
4 out 9 Of the strategies are addressed in the policy document (44%)				
Ambiguity in the law banning CSM	i. Develop simple, clear and understandable policies/law to regulate artisanal milling	4.3.1 (iii) Partially		8 (Kade, Oda, Assin Foso, Begoro, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Create awareness/educate stakeholders on the laws/policies	Crosscutting		4 (Begoro, Assin Foso,

		Issue		Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iii. Build capacity of prosecutors in forest laws		✓	1 (Assin Foso)
2 out of the 3 strategies are addressed in the policy document (67%)				
Easy entry into the trade	i. Facilitate the establishment of artisanal milling and lumber dealers groups/ associations at various levels, e.g. local, district, regional and national to regulate entry into the trade	4.3.5 (ii)		8 (Kade, Begoro, Oda, Assin Foso, Goaso, Juaso , Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Develop a mechanism to register and regulate all certified artisanal millers	4.3.5 (ii)		8 (Kade, Begoro, Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Sunyani , Nkawie, Juaso)
	iii. Review regulations on importation of chainsaw machines to control it use.	4.3.2 (i)		2 (Begoro, Sunyani)
	iv. Develop a model of artisanal milling based on area of operation.	4.3.1 (iv)		1 (Kade)
All the 4 strategies are addressed in the policy document (100%)				
Lack of political will to enforce the ban and political interference	i. Sensitize politicians, including traditional authorities on laws/policies concerning the artisanal milling concept and forest management	Crosscutting issues		7 (Kade, Assin Foso, Begoro, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Sunyani)
	ii. Institute a name and shame policy against any public office holders/politicians who interfere with the activities of forestry		✓	6 (Kade, Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	iii. Encourage civil societies to provide platform to politicians (political parties) to outline their forest management policies during campaign season		✓	6 (Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Sunyani, Nkawie, Juaso)
	iv. Establish a neutral body/platform to address complains/issues that may arise		✓	3 (Assin Foso, Begoro, Oda)
	v. Strengthen institutions concern with implementation of artisanal milling to be able to deal with political pressures		✓	3 (Oda, Juaso, Nkawie)

	vi. Lobby parliament to enact laws restraining politicians from interfering in forestry issues especially appointment of CEO of FC and involvement in illegal logging issues		✓	3 (Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie)
	vii. Facilitate development of legal instrument protecting forestry official s and other security agencies who enforce the laws		✓	1 (Assin Foso)
1 out of the 7 strategies is addressed in the policy document (14%)				
Cross border trade	i. Ban overland export of artisanal milled lumber and develop heavy sanctions/punishment to offenders. (CONFLICTING)			7 (Kade, Begoro Goaso, Oda, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Develop systems to strictly check and enforce ban on export of artisanal milled lumber			5 (Kade, Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Juaso)
	iii. Develop a specialise over land export market for artisanal millers who wants to export (CONFLICTING)			3 (Kade, Assin Foso, Goaso)
	iv. Facilitate development of lucrative pricing for artisanal milled lumber			2 (Begoro , Oda)
	v. Involve security of neighboring countries to assist in enforcing the ban.		✓	1 (Oda)
Lack of sustained public awareness creation	i. Carry out sensitization and awareness creation on the ban on chainsaw milling and artisanal milling concept	Crosscutting issue		8 (Kade, Assin Foso, Begoro, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii. Institute funding mechanism and establish conservation education unit.	Crosscutting issue		3 (Sunyani, Juaso, Nkawie)
	iii. Build capacities of stakeholders especially at the communities level to assist in public awareness creation	Crosscutting issue		2 (Kade , Assin Foso)
	iv. Lobby to include forestry education in school curriculum and facilitate establishment of forest clubs in schools	Crosscutting issue		2 (Kade, Oda)
	v. Involve stakeholders in education programme	Crosscutting		2 (Juso, Nkawie)

		issue			
All strategies are addressed in the policy document under crosscutting issues (100%)					
Appropriateness of CSM technology in areas where it is not economical for conventional logging	i.	Will be addressed with the inception of the artisanal milling concept			8 (Kade, Oda, Assin Foso, Begoro, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii.	Encourage putting such areas into community forest or other uses			2 (Kade, Juaso)
Lack of proper means for securing protected areas	i.	Build capacity of local people to assist in securing forested areas and monitoring	4.3.2 (v) 4.3.3 (ii)		7 (Kade, Assin Foso, Oda, Goaso, Juaso, Nkawie, Sunyani)
	ii.	Enhance capacity of FC frontline staff to work effectively		✓	5 (Kade, Begoro, Oda, Goaso, Nkawie)
	iii.	Clearly demarcate protected areas		✓	2 (Juso, Sunyani)
	iv.	Create a paramilitary section similar to that in Wildlife Division		✓	1 (Begoro)
	v.	Involve artisanal milling groups/association to secure protected areas within their operational areas	4.3.1 (v)		1 (Juso)
	vi.	Encourage communities to establish dedicated forests		✓	1 (Nkawie)
2 out of the 6 strategies are addressed in the in the policy document (33%)					

Annex 4. Outcome of Technical Committee meeting on strategies not addressed/covered in the draft policy document

Driver	Strategy	Decision
Domestic market demand	Review AAC and adhere to it under the artisanal milling concept	FORIG has been tasked by the FC to look at the AAC.
Rural unemployment	Encourage timber Companies to employ workers (especially unskilled labour) from rural communities where they are sited.	Administrative issue: In SRA negotiations, communities should be encourage to factor in employment opportunities for the local people
Weak institutions	Develop a system where a quota of revenue generated from the districts can be retained by the districts/frontline offices for operations and ensure effective supervision of staff	Administrative issues: For FSD to consider
	Define clearly roles of various institutions concern with forest management	Administrative issue: FSD should enforce the manual of operations and management plans
	Establish a Para-military unit similar to what Wildlife Division have	On-going initiatives to trains some selected FSD staff as Para-military
	Increase the number of district offices (The district offices are too big)	Administrative issue: For FSD to consider
Corruption	Strengthen the existing laws on corruption to include stiffer punishment for offenders and reward sincere staff	New Strategy to be included in the draft policy document “ Improve sector governance to address corruption ” under objective 3 (promote good governance in the supply of timber on the domestic market)
	Introduce good conditions of service for security agencies	
	Name a shame corrupt traditional authorities and politicians	
	Ensure speedy prosecution of forestry related cases.	
	Trained prosecutors (FC staff) in forestry law at various districts to prosecute cases and establish special courts to deal illegal cases that will arise	On-going initiative to train FSD staff to prosecute cases
Ambiguity in the law banning CSM	Build capacity of prosecutors in forest laws	On-going initiative to train FSD staff to prosecute cases
Lack of political will to enforce the ban and political interference	Institute a name and shame policy against any public office holders/politicians who interfere with the activities of forestry	Should be flagged for relevant institution/sector to take it up
	Encourage civil societies to provide platform to politicians (political parties) to outline their forest management policies during campaign season	New strategy to be included in the draft policy document “ Encourage civil society to provide platforms for politicians (political parties) to outline their forest management policies during campaigns ” under cross cutting issues
	Establish a neutral body/platform to address complains/issues that may arise	Administrative issue: The VPA and TVD platform could serve a neutral body to address issues that will be arising from the artisanal milling concept
	Strengthen institutions concern with implementation of artisanal milling to be able to deal with political pressures	Administrative issue: FC should take it up

	Lobby parliament to enact laws restraining politicians from interfering in forestry issues especially appointment of CEO of FC and involvement in illegal logging issues.	Should be flagged for relevant institution/sector : The code of ethics for the appointment of public sector officials should be enforced
	Facilitate development of legal instrument protecting forestry official s and other security agencies who enforce the laws	not an issues to be considered at this level
Lack of proper means for securing protected areas	Enhance capacity of FC frontline staff to work effectively	Administrative issue: taken up by FC
	Clearly demarcate protected areas	Administrative issues: FSD should ensure proper monitoring and enforcement
	Create a paramilitary section similar to that in Wildlife Division	On-going initiatives to trains some selected FSD staff as Para-military
	Encourage communities to establish dedicated forests	On-going initiative by FC to encourage communities to establish dedicated forests
Cross border trade	Ban overland export of artisanal milled lumber and develop heavy sanctions/punishment to offenders.	The concept of artisanal milling is basically to supply lumber to the local market. This idea will be defeated if a special market is set up to trade in artisanal milled lumber. Cross border trade in artisanal milled lumber should therefore be ban
	Develop systems to strictly check and enforce ban on export of artisanal milled lumber	
	Develop a specialise over land export market for artisanal millers who wants to export	
	Facilitate development of lucrative pricing for artisanal milled lumber	