

**“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”**

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

**Third District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue (DLMSD III) Minutes  
Nkawie**

**Date: 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2010**

**Venue: Catholic Conference Hall**



### **DLMSD Members Present:**

1. Samuel Owusu	Hunter, Kyekyewere
2. Kwabena Twumasi	Chainsaw Operator, Kyekyewere
3. Beatrice Gyaw	Farmer, Kyekyewere
4. Joseph Manu	Farmer, Kyekyewere
5. Victoria Owusu Konadu	Lumber Dealer, Nyanahene
6. Sgt Justine Sonta	GPS, Nyanahene
7. Kusi Appiahene	Judiciary Service, Nyanahene
8. Kofi Akomeng	Sawmiller, Nyanahene
9. Joseph Domfeh	Fire Volunteer, Nyanahene
10. Abraham Owusu	TA, Kyekyewere
11. Nana Osei Afriyie	Sawmiller, Nyanahene
12. Felicia Afriyie	Sawmiller, Nyanahene
13. Adda Sam	FSD, Nkawie
14. Fosu Lawrence	FSD, Nkawie
15. Osei Kojo,	NADMO, Nyanahene
16. Nana Sarfo	Sawmiller, Nyanahene
17. Percy O. Asamoah	FSD, Nkawie
18. Benard Bekoe	GNA, Nyanahene

### **Project Team**

1. Mercy Owusu Ansah	NF/CFA, EU CSM Project
2. Emmanuel Fosu	PA, CSM Project, Ghana
3. Patrick Opoku	Intern, TBI
4. Evans Sampene	National Service, TBI
5. Jullia Almeida	Intern, CSM Project
6. Lawrence Fosu	CFW

### **Acronyms**

CFC	Community Forestry Committee
CFW	Community Forestry Worker
CSM	Chainsaw Milling
DFF	District Forest Forum
DLMSD	District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
EU	European Union
FORIG	Forestry Research Institute of Ghana
FSD	Forest Service Division
GNA	Ghana News Agency
GPS	Ghana Police Service
MSD	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
NADMO	National Disaster Management organisation
NF/CFA	National Facilitator/Community Forestry Advisor
PA	Project Assistant
SWOT	Strength, Weakness, Opportunity, Threat
TBI	Tropenbos International

### **Agenda:**

The agreed agenda for the meeting were to:

- Reading and acceptance of minutes
- Purpose of the meeting
- Reports/feedback from the national MSD 3

- Strategies to mitigate weaknesses and threats from the SWOT analysis of the 3 recommended options
- Stakeholder perception and alternative livelihood survey

Proceedings	Action
<p><b>1.0 Opening</b> The PA called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. after prayer by Ms Victoria Owusu Konadu, a lumber dealer from Nyanahene.</p> <p><b>2.0 Introductions</b> Members present took turns to introduce themselves stating their stakeholder group and community. The NF formally introduced Mr. Lawrence Fosu, the new CFW and explained that he has taken over from Mr Isaac Sintim Yabbey who has been transferred to Sunyani in the Brong Ahafo region.</p> <p><b>3.0 Reading of Previous Minutes</b> The PA read the previous minutes and after some corrections, Mr. Kusi Appiah moved for the acceptance of the minutes. This was seconded by Mr Samuel Owusu.</p> <p><b>4.0 Purpose of meeting</b> The CFW outlined the purpose of the meeting as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Give feedback from National MSD 3;</li> <li>• Discuss strategies to address threats and weaknesses from the SWOT analysis of the three options; and</li> <li>• Collect information on perception about the project and discuss alternative livelihoods options.</li> </ul> <p><b>5.0 Feedback from national MSD 3</b> The PA and members from the district who attended the national MSD 4 meeting presented what took place at the meeting. Their presentations covered the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Code of conduct</li> <li>➤ Outcomes of the SWOT analysis from the districts</li> <li>➤ Strategy to address the weaknesses and threats from the SWOT analysis of the three recommended options.</li> <li>➤ Preferred policy options by stakeholders</li> </ul> <p><b>6.0 Group Discussions on Strategies to Address Weaknesses and Threats from the SWOT analysis of the 3 recommended policy options</b></p> <p>The PA presented the weaknesses and threats from the SWOT analysis. After answering questions, Members went into 3 groups to discuss strategies to address threats and weaknesses from the three options. Group reporters presented their groups' outcome.(Detail in annex)</p> <p>After the group presentations, each member was asked to write on piece paper his/her preferred option. The outcome was collected on stakeholder basis. Below are the results:</p>	

Stakeholder	No	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
<b>Traditional Authority</b>	1	-	1 (100%)	-
<b>Chainsaw Stakeholders</b> <i>Related</i>	12	-	9 (75%)	3 (25%)
<b>Government Institution</b>	5	-	5 (100%)	-
<b>Total</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>15 (83.3%)</b>	<b>3 (16.7%)</b>

**7.0 Livelihood Studies**

The livelihood survey group explained the purpose of the studies and said it is clear that whichever option is selected, some people are likely to lose their livelihood. It is therefore important that viable alternative livelihoods are identified and piloted to support these people. The team then collected information from members using guided questions.

**11.0 Date for Next Meeting**

The date for the next DLMSD will be communicated to participants after the 4<sup>th</sup> national MSD meeting.

**12.0 Closing**

The NF thanked all present and advised that they send feedback to members of their communities. The meeting ended at 3:35:00pm



Signed  
Emmanuel Fosu – Recorder



Signed:  
Mercy Owusu Ansah (Chairperson)

**Annex: Weakness and Threats with Strategies to address them**  
**Option 1: Sawmillers only to Supply Domestic Lumber**

<b>Weakness</b>	<b>Strategy</b>
High operational cost leading to high lumber prices.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sawmillers should adopt the use of more efficient equipment to reduce waste.</li> <li>• The industry could plead with the government to reduce tax on timber equipment and products.</li> <li>• Management should be trained to improve their managerial skills to reduce acts that lead to high cost in production.</li> <li>• Establish sales outlet in nearby communities to reduce cost of transportation.</li> </ul>
Unhealthy competition among sawmills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There should be a mediation body to resolve any conflict that may arise as a result of unhealthy competition.</li> </ul>
Inadequate financial resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sawmills should establish good corporate relationships with financial institutions in order to get loans to run their businesses.</li> </ul>
Lack of technology to operate in difficult terrains. Example valleys and hilly areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Modern technologies should be explored and tried.</li> </ul>
High environmental impact including crop damage.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Environmental assessment should be carried out by VPA to measure the extent of damage the operation will cost and the necessary compensations paid to the rightful losers before logging is carried out.</li> </ul>
Difficulties in supplying local communities due to limited number of sawmills in the local communities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There should be a law which makes mandatory for all sawmills to open specific number of sales outlets in communities they harvest their timber from.</li> </ul>
Poor managerial skill	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The industry can identify and recommend a body to train her members in modern managerial skills for affordable fees.</li> <li>• Sawmills should engage qualified personnel to manage their businesses and be ready to pay competitive remuneration.</li> </ul>
Waste due to selective logging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FC/FSD Officers and Environmentalist should be able to assess the extent of damage that a selected tree logging can cost in order to decide whether it is environmentally prudent to permit logging.</li> </ul>
Strong desire to export than to supply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Award of specific hectares of concession should go with specific tons of lumber supply to the domestic market which should be strictly monitored.</li> </ul>
Dwindling resource base	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All stakeholders should engage in massive tree planting.</li> <li>• The FC should institute a policy to allocate a degraded forest or an area within the forest region for the Sawmiller to plant whilst logging on her concession <b>and not plant after logging.</b></li> </ul>
Low pricing in the local market	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FC, the industry and other bodies which are expert in price determination can come out with regulated range of prices for various lumber sizes for all lumber dealers.</li> </ul>
Influx of mushroom sawmills to produce low quality product	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FC in collaboration with the industry should spell out modalities to be met before a business could be registered as sawmill for award of concession to operate.</li> </ul>
Fire outbreaks in the forests and workplaces.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formation and well equipped fire volunteers in forest fringe communities.</li> <li>• Education of activities which are likely to spark off fire and how to avoid them.</li> </ul>
Difficulty in operating in undulating areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Industry can sit with government to allow the use of helicopters to pull timber.</li> </ul>
Illegal chainsaw milling in concessions and associated conflicts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Institution of concession guards who are well trained and mandated to deal with concession trespassers severely.</li> <li>• Sawmillers should equip and pay well their concession guards so that they may not fall prey to bribery.</li> </ul>
Unwillingness of rural communities to cooperate with sawmillers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sawmillers should train and employ people from the rural communities. They should also pay their SRAs in order to will the confidence of the locals for cooperation.</li> </ul>

High taxation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Negotiate with the government to reduce tax on lumber equipment.</li> </ul>
Problems with resource allocation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FC should formulate a policy which will eliminate or reduce possible problems.</li> </ul>
Unsustainable supply of utility services. E.g. electricity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sawmillers should procure their own plants to produce electricity.</li> </ul>

### Option 2 – Sawmills and Artisanal Millers to Supply Domestic Lumber

Weakness	Strategy
Community unit committees and other monitoring bodies are not functional due to lack of resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unit committees in forest fringe communities should have forest sub committee responsible for the forest with clearly defined mandate and authority and motivated to help protect the forest.</li> <li>• Define roles in relation to forest management.</li> </ul>
National data capturing system is weak.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ All FC/FSD offices should be networked to a central point and among all regional and district offices for easy access to information.</li> <li>▪ Provide computers and other logistics for data capturing</li> </ul>
Difficulty in monitoring the operations of the two parties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There should be standards which should be followed by the two parties.</li> <li>▪ Increase the number of personnel to enhance monitoring.</li> <li>▪ Unit committees and traditional rulers should be motivated and given authority to monitor the two parties.</li> </ul>
Use of obsolete machinery on the part of sawmillers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The industry should encourage members to use modern and more efficient equipment.</li> <li>▪ Government should subsidise the cost of machinery</li> </ul>
Conflicts between artisanal and saw millers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There should be standing mediation body made up of FC/FSD, industry, artisanal millers, unit committee and traditional authority to mediate conflicts.</li> </ul>
The blend may lead to corrupt practices.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Institute stiffer punishment to offenders.</li> </ul>
Most artisanal millers use human beings to convey lumber to accessible places which can be very risky.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ They should be trained in work safety and hazard identification.</li> </ul>
Illegal logging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The law and law enforcers should deal with that without fear or favour.</li> </ul>
Depletion of timber resource	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The two parties should plant trees.</li> <li>▪ Encouragement of community based afforestation.</li> <li>▪ There should be a fallow period to ensure that trees have re-vegetated before allowing entry.</li> </ul>
Loss of jobs by some operators who cannot afford the improved technology.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Train the operators in other alternative sources of livelihoods. Eg mechanics, electricians</li> <li>▪ Train operators in the skills of identifying opportunities and how to manage small businesses.</li> </ul>
Difficulty in monitoring the two parties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Use traditional rulers and unit committees to monitor their activities.</li> </ul>
Lack of political will to enforce laws.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Policies should favour all parties.</li> </ul>
National data capturing system is weak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ All FC/FSD offices should be networked to a central point and among all regional and district offices for easy access to information.</li> </ul>
Likely fall in profit as a result of oversupply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The two bodies can form amalgamation to regulate the supply to avoid glut on the domestic market.</li> </ul>
Potential differences in prices of lumber.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Establishment of price control systems by a recognized price control board formed by the two bodies.</li> </ul>
High cost of equipments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Government should subsidise the cost of forest equipment.</li> <li>▪ Reduce tax on importation of forest equipment.</li> </ul>
Potential problems with utility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ensure economical use of utilities.</li> </ul>

services.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Institutions should try to procure facilities which will enable them provide some of these utilities by themselves.</li> </ul>
Interference by traditional authorities and farmers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Define roles and responsibilities.</li> <li>▪ Educate individual on the dangers of deforestation.</li> <li>▪ Involve traditional authorities in forest management.</li> </ul>

### Option 3: Artisanal Operators only to Supply Domestic Lumber

Weakness	Strategy
Improved operations imply extra cost to artisanal millers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Artisanal millers should form associations so as to be able to solicit for loans.</li> <li>▪ Members should create cordial relationships with banks in order to be able to access loans to enhance operations.</li> </ul>
Poor managerial skills of artisanal operators constitute a weakness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The FC should organise management trainings for artisanal millers to improve their managerial skills.</li> </ul>
Legalising artisanal milling may affect the rate at which the forest is diminishing.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ FC/FSD should encourage them to cultivate their own plantations and also embark on afforestation after logging.</li> </ul>
Increased conflict and competition between sawmillers and artisanal millers on forest resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ FC/FSD should be fair in concession allocation (resources distribution) to avoid conflict.</li> </ul>
Lack of technical know-how to operate the improved technology equipment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Artisanal millers should be taken through training sessions as to how the logosol and the wood mizers are used.</li> </ul>
Artisanal millers do not compensate farmers adequately.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There should be fix prices for compensations and flexible modalities to follow.</li> </ul>
Potential abuse of permit issued by FC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ FC should institute and met out stiffer sanctions to persons or organisations that abuse the permit.</li> </ul>
Artisanal millers do not have the capacity to supply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Government should reduce tax on timber machinery and subsidise the cost so that artisanal millers can afford to improve their capacity to supply domestic lumber.</li> </ul>
Dwindling of the forest resource leading to competition with saw millers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Concession should be awarded on merit, devoid of all corrupt practices.</li> </ul>
Ineffective monitoring mechanisms.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ FC should employ more personnel to assist in monitoring.</li> <li>▪ FC to review her monitoring systems to make it more effective and efficient.</li> </ul>
High operational cost due to taxation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Appeal to the government give tax rebate to artisanal millers.</li> </ul>
Inability to acquire artisanal equipment/mills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Artisanal millers to form cooperatives to procure mills.</li> </ul>
Extreme weather conditions affecting production and forest health.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Very little could be done about this threat.</li> </ul>
Lack of transparency in resource allocation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There should fairness in resources allocation to avoid illegality in the sector.</li> </ul>
Weak law enforcement in the country.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Law enforcers should be motivated and paid living wages so that these will not be the temptation of bribery.</li> </ul>