

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

**Third District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue Minutes
Assin Foso**

Date: 23rd July, 2010

Venue: Municipal Assembly Hall, Assin Foso



The logo for the EU Chainsaw Project is centered around a large, five-pointed yellow star. Inside the star, the text "EU Chainsaw Project" is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font. Below this text, the logo for the Forestry Commission (AFC) is displayed, consisting of a green tree silhouette and the letters "AFC" in green, with "Forestry Commission" written in black below it. At the bottom of the star, the text "IWOKRAMA" is written in a green, stylized font, with a small globe icon integrated into the letter "O".

Surrounding the star are several logos and flags:

- Top left: The flag of the European Union, a blue rectangle with twelve yellow stars arranged in a circle.
- Top right: The logo for Tropenbos International Ghana, featuring a green globe with a tree silhouette and the text "TROPENBOS INTERNATIONAL" and "GHANA" below it.
- Bottom left: The logo for the Forestry Training Centre (FTC), featuring a green circle with a white sunburst and a yellow silhouette of Ghana, with the text "FORESTRY TRAINING CENTRE (FTC)" around the top.
- Bottom right: The logo for the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) Ghana, featuring a red circle with a blue gear and the text "CSIR" and "COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC AND INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH GHANA" around the perimeter, with "FORIG" below it.

At the bottom of the star, the text "This project is financed by the European Union" is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font.

Present

Name	Stakeholder
1. Nana Kwakye	TA, Assin Foso
2. Gabriel Narh	Chainsaw Operator, Breman Asikuma
3. Edwin Fiifi Acquah	Lumber Dealer, Breman Asikuma
4. Ebenezer Obo Cann	Table Top Sawmiller, Breman Asikuma
5. Kweku Nyame	Table Top Sawmiller, Breman Asikuma
6. Yaw Effah	Lumber Dealer, Breman Asikuma
7. Hayford Asofa	Carrier, Breman Asikuma
8. David Kobina Amoah	Environment Health, Assin Foso
9. Dzisenu Desmond	MOFA, Assin North Municipal Assembly
10. Abraham Bentsil	Chainsaw Operator, Assin Bankyease
11. Simon Sam	Chainsaw Operator, Assin Bankyease
12. Abukre Sadique	Carrier, Assin Andoe
13. John Tetteh	Chainsaw Operator, Assin Andoe
14. Kweku Seidu	Chainsaw Operator, Assin Bankyease
15. Nana Ajona	Chainsaw Operator, Assin Krobo
16. Elijah Andorful	Chainsaw Operator, Chainsaw Operator
17. Patrick Danso	NADMO, Assin Foso
18. Stephen F. Danquah	FSD, Assin Foso
19. Daniel Y. Ansah	Lumber Dealer, Assin Foso
20. Eshun Mutala	Lumber Dealer, Twifo Praso
21. Emmanuel Asamoah	Lumber Dealer, Twifo Praso
22. Nana Afranse IV	TA, Assin Foso
23. Stephen K. Boafo	Chainsaw Operation, Assin Foso

In Attendance

1. Mr I.C.Y. Apetorgbor	District Manager, FSD, Assin Foso
-------------------------	-----------------------------------

Project Secretariat

1. Emmanuel Fosu	PA, EU CSM project
2. Seth Duodu	CFW, EU CSM Project
3. Patrick Opoku	Intern, TBI
4. Evan Sampene	Intern, TBI
5. Jullia	Intern, TBI

Acronyms

• CFW	Community Forestry Worker
• CSM	Chainsaw Milling
• DLMSD	District Level Multi-stakeholder Dialogue
• EU	European Commission
• FC	Forestry Commission
• FSD	Forestry Services Division

- MOFA Ministry of Food and Agriculture
- MSD Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
- NADMO National Disaster Management Organisation
- TA Traditional Authority
- VPA Voluntary Partnership Agreement

Agenda

The agreed agenda for the meeting are:

- Purpose of the meeting
- Reading and acceptance of minutes
- Reports/feedback from the national MSD 3
- Strategies to mitigate weaknesses and threats from the SWOT analysis of the 3 recommended options
- Stakeholder perception and alternative livelihood survey

Proceedings	Action
<p>1.0 Opening The meeting started at 10:30 am after a prayer by Mr. Abraham Bentsil, a chainsaw operator from Assin Bankyease.</p> <p>2.0 Introductions The CFW introduced the team from the project secretariat. This was followed by self introduction by the stakeholders.</p> <p>2.1 Welcome Address by the District Manager In his welcome address the District Manager, said the MSD is an ongoing process to fine a lasting solution to the illegal CSM and that each MSD builds on a previous one. He entreated stakeholders to ensure consistency in their participation in the MSD meeting and ensure that they report back/send feed back to their groups/constituencies in their respective communities.</p> <p>3.0 Purpose of the Meeting The CFW outlined the purpose of the meeting as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Send feedback from National MSD 3; ii. Discuss strategies to address threats and weaknesses from the SWOT analysis of the three options; and iii. Collect information on perception about the project and discuss alternative livelihoods options. <p>4.0 Reading and Acceptance of the Previous Minutes Mr. Dzisenu Desmond of the MOFA read the previous minutes. After correcting some errors, Mr. Daniel Ansah, a lumber dealer moved for the acceptance of the previous minutes and was seconded by Nana Ansah Kwakye, a Traditional Ruler.</p>	

5.0 Feedback from the National MSD 3

Mr S.K. Boafo, a chainsaw operator from Assin Foso reported what transpired during the national MSD 3 in Kumasi. He presented how the three options came about and the various stages it has passed through: the SWOT analysis and discussions on strategies to address the weaknesses and the threats from the SWOT analysis.

6.0 Group Discussions: Strategies to Address Weaknesses and Threats from the SWOT analysis of the 3 recommended policy options

Members went into 3 groups to discuss strategies to address threats and weaknesses from the three options. Group representatives presented their groups' outcome.(Detail in annex)

7.0 Choice of Option based on Stakeholdership

After the presentations of the strategies to address weaknesses and threats from the SWOT analysis, stakeholders selected their preferred options by writing on a paper secretly. The result is as follows:

Stakeholder	No	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
<i>Traditional Authority</i>	1	-	(1) 100%	-
<i>Chainsaw Related Stakeholders</i>	15	-	(9) 60%	(6) 40%
<i>Government Institution</i>	5	-	(5) 100%	-
Total	21	-	(15) 71.4%	(6) 28.6%


8.0 Livelihood Survey

The livelihood survey team took explained the rationale for the survey and collected their information using guided questions and questionnaires.

9.0 Closing and Closing Remarks by the Chairman

The Chairman thanked participants for their time and patient and finally entreated all to disseminate information about the project to their group/constituencies in their communities.

The CFW on behalf of the project thanked all participants for attending the meeting. The meeting ended at 3:47 pm.

Signed: 
Mr I.C.Y. Apetorgbor-Dist. Mgr (Chairman)

Signed: 
Emmanuel Fosu (Recorder)

Annex Option 1: Sawmillers only to Supply Domestic Lumber

Weakness	Strategy
High operational cost leading to high lumber prices.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should use of efficient equipment to reduce waste. • The industry could plead with the government to reduce tax on timber equipment and products. • Capacity building to improve efficiency. • Establish sales outlet in nearby communities to reduce cost of transportation.
Unhealthy competition among sawmills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There should be a mediation body to resolve any conflict that may arise as a result of unhealthy competition.
Inadequate financial resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmills should establish good corporate relationships with financial institutions in order to access credits.
Lack of technology to operate in difficult terrains. Example valleys and hilly areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The use of high technologies like helicopters to harvest logs.
High environmental impact including crop damage.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact assessment should be carried out to assess potential damage and the necessary compensations before logging is carried out.
Difficulties in supplying local communities due to limited number of sawmills in the local communities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There should be a law which makes it mandatory for all sawmills to open specific number of sales outlets in communities they harvest their timber from.
Poor managerial skill	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The industry can identify and recommend a body to train their staff in modern managerial skills for affordable fees. • Sawmills should engage qualified personnel to manage their businesses and be ready to pay competitive remuneration.
Waste due to selective logging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC/FSD Officers and Environmentalist should be able to assess the extent of damage that a selected tree logging can cost in order to decide whether it is environmentally sound to permit logging.
Strong desire to export than to supply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government should reduce export of lumber and force the industry to supply a quota to the domestic market and this should be strictly monitored.
Threat	Strategy
Dwindling resource base	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All stakeholders should engage in massive tree planting. • The FC should institute a policy to allocate degraded forests to saw miller to plant whilst logging on their concession <i>and not plant after logging.</i>
Low pricing in the local market	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC, the industry and other bodies should come out with regulated range of prices for various lumber sizes for all lumber dealers.
Influx of mushroom sawmills to produce low quality product	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC in collaboration with the industry should develop conditions/criteria for registering sawmilling business.
Fire outbreaks in the forests and workplaces.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formation and well equipped fire volunteers in forest fringe communities. • Education and public awareness creation
Illegal chainsaw milling in concessions and associated conflicts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should hire their own concession guards. • Sawmillers should equip and pay well their concession guards
Unwillingness of rural communities to cooperate with sawmillers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public education and awareness creation on SRA • Prompt payment of SRAs to communities
Problems with resource allocation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC should formulate a policy which will eliminate or reduce possible problems.
Unsustainable supply of utility services. E.g. electricity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should procure their own generating plants to supplement power generation.

Option 2 – Sawmills and Artisanal Millers to Supply Domestic Lumber

Weakness	Strategy
Community unit committees and other monitoring bodies are not functional due to lack of resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create, build and empower CFCs to assist in forest management and monitoring.
National data capturing system is weak.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FSD offices should be networked to a central point for easy access to information.
Difficulty in monitoring the operations of the two parties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Develop standards for both sawmills and artisanal millers ▪ Communities should be motivated and empowered to help in monitoring
Use of obsolete machinery on the part of sawmillers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The industry should use efficient equipment.
Conflicts between artisanal and saw millers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There should be standing mediation/conflict management body to deal with conflicts.
Most artisanal millers use human beings to convey lumber to accessible places which can be very risky.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Develop safety standards
Illegal logging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Law enforcement should be strong
Threat	Strategy
Depletion of timber resource	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Sawmills and artisanal millers should partner with the FC to embark on afforestation. They should also be encouraged to own plantations. ▪ Government should develop a policy to reduce exploitation or strictly log based on sustainable AAC.
Loss of jobs by some operators who cannot afford the improved technology.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provide viable alternative livelihoods. ▪ Build capacity of operators to identify other livelihood opportunities and manage small businesses.
Difficulty in monitoring the two parties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Build capacity and empower communities assist in forest management and monitoring.
National data capturing system is weak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FSD offices should be networked to a central point for easy access to information.
Likely fall in profit as a result of oversupply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC should regulate supply to avoid price drop on the domestic market.
Potential differences in prices of lumber.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Taxes for both artisanal and sawmillers should be the same.
High cost of equipments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Government should reduce tax on importation of equipment.
Potential problems with utility services.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Institutions should try to procure facilities which will enable them provide some of these utilities by themselves.
Interference by traditional authorities and farmers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Strict enforcement of the policies and laws.

Option 3: Artisanal Operators only to Supply Domestic Lumber

Weakness	Strategy
Improved operations imply extra cost to artisanal millers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Capacity of artisanal millers should be built and assisted to form recognised associations to access credits.
Poor managerial skills of artisanal operators constitute a weakness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Capacity of artisanal millers should be built to improve upon management of their business
Legalizing artisanal milling may affect the rate at which the forest is diminishing.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC/FSD should encourage them to develop their own plantations and also encourage to partners with the FC on afforestation programmes.

Lack of technical know-how to operate the improved technology equipment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build artisanal millers' capacity to handle improved equipments
Artisanal millers do not compensate farmers adequately.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Create public awareness about artisanal milling including all obligations to the communities.
Potential abuse of permit issued by FC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Full enforcement of the laws and policies including sanctions to persons or associations who abuse the system.
Artisanal millers do not have the capacity to supply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build their capacity in efficiency and institute standards.
<i>Threat</i>	<i>Strategy</i>
Dwindling of the forest resource leading to competition with saw millers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Areas should be demarcated (possibly off-reserves) for artisanal millers. Artisanal millers should be encourage to develop their own plantation and also partner FC to plant trees
Ineffective monitoring mechanisms.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC should build the capacity and equip its frontline staff and also to review its monitoring systems to make it more effective and efficient. FC should also involve local people by building their capacity and empowering them
High operational.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Government should reduce tax paid by artisanal millers.
Inability to acquire artisanal equipment/mills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Government can import and sell to artisanal equipments to millers on credit.
Extreme weather conditions affecting production and forest health.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Very little could be done about this threat.
Lack of transparency in resource allocation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There should fairness in resources allocation to avoid illegality in the sector.
Weak law enforcement in the country.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Political will is needed to address this.