

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

**Third District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue Minutes
Akyem Oda**

Date: 22nd July, 2010

Venue: Municipal Assembly Hall



The logo for the EU Chainsaw Project is centered around a large, five-pointed yellow star. Inside the star, the text "EU Chainsaw Project" is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font. Surrounding the star are several logos: the European Union flag (a blue rectangle with twelve yellow stars) in the top left; the Tropenbos International Ghana logo (a green globe with a tree) in the top right; the Forestry Commission logo (the letters "AFC" in green with a tree) in the center; the Forestry Training Centre logo (a green circle with a tree and sun) in the bottom left; the IWOKRAMA logo (the letters "IWOKRAMA" in green with a globe) in the bottom center; and the CSIR logo (a red circle with "CSIR" in blue) in the bottom right. Below the star, the text "This project is financed by the European Union" is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font.

Present

Name	Stakeholder
1. Isaac Kwao	NTFP Collector, Aproxumasi
2. Kofi Nyame	NTFP Collector, Aproxumasi
3. Ofori Attah Jnr	Chainsaw Operator, Aproxumasi
4. Charles Obeng	NTFP Collector, Aproxumasi
5. Kwadwo Mahama	Chainsaw Operator, Aproxumasi
6. Alex Anim	Chainsaw Operator, Akyem Aprade
7. Kwasi Anaafi	Machine Owner, Chainsaw Operator
8. James Badu	Machine Owner, Akyem Aprade
9. Odai Laryea	Machine Owner, Akyem Otwereso
10. Ransford Akomaning	Chainsaw Operator, Apoli Ningo
11. Armoo Dacosta	Lumber Dealer, Akyem Oda
12. Stephen Obeng	Lumber Dealer, Akyem Oda
13. James Appiah	Carrier, Apoli Ningo
14. Kwaku Dwamina	Machine Owner, Apoli Ningo
15. Paa Bonzi	Lumber Dealer, Akyem Oda
16. Oduro Asante	Lumber Dealer, Akyem Oda
17. John Afful	Chainsaw Operator, Nyame Nti
18. Kwabena Amankwah Andoh	Lumber Dealer, Nyame Nti
19. Kwame Attafuah	Lumber Dealer, Akyem Oda
20. Fabian Sallah	Ghana Police Service, Akyem Oda
21. Francis Amedrator	MOFA, Akyem Oda
22. Osabarima Ofosu Kwabi III	Traditional Authority, Otwereso
23. Nana Kwadwo Yeboah	Traditional Authority, Otwereso
24. Daniel Korankye	District Assembly, Birim Central-Akyem Oda
25. Samuel Dzanlu	Ghana National Fire Service, Akyem Oda
26. Esther Mensah	Ghana Immigration Service, Akyem Oda
27. Johnson Antirakwa	FSD, Akyem Oda
28. Nana Owusu Aduamoah II	Traditional Authority, Apoli Ningo
29. Emit Ohene Djan	FSD, Akyem Oda
30. Samuel K. Gyeabour	FSD, Akyem Oda
31. Richard Nana Gyasi	FSD, Akyem Oda
32. Kofi Osei Mensah	FSD, Akyem Oda
33. Prosper Adzah	FSD, Akyem Oda
34. Faustina Annor	FSD, Akyem Oda
35. Franklin N. Cobblah	BNI, Akyem Oda
36. Alfred Vieku	FSD, Akyem Oda
37. Charles Nketiah	FSD, Akyem Oda
38. Korankye Daniel	District Assembly, Birim South – Akyem Swedru
39. Hannah Quaison	Lumber Dealer, Akyem Swedru
40. Abubakari Donkor	Chainsaw Mechanic, Apoli Ningo
41. Ransford Asomaning	Chainsaw Operator, Akyem Aprade

Project Secretariat

1. James Parker	NPC, EU CSM project
2. Emmanuel Fosu	PA, EU CSM project
3. Patrick Opoku	Intern, TBI

- | | |
|------------------|--------------------------|
| 4. Evan Sampene | Service Personnel, TBI |
| 5. Iulia Almeida | Intern, Chainsaw Project |

Agenda:

The agreed agenda for the meeting are:

- Purpose of the meeting
- Reports/feedback on the national MSD 3
- Choice of options based on stakeholdership
- Strategies to mitigate weaknesses and threats of 3 options
- Stakeholder perception survey

Acronyms

- | | |
|---------|---|
| • CFW | Community Forestry Worker |
| • CSM | Chainsaw Milling |
| • DCE | District Chief Executive |
| • DFF | District Forest Forum |
| • DFM | District Finance Manager |
| • DLMSD | District Level Multi-stakeholder Dialogue |
| • EU | European Commission |
| • FC | Forestry Commission |
| • FSD | Forestry Services Division |
| • GNFS | Ghana National Fire Service |
| • MOFA | Ministry of Food and Agriculture |
| • MSD | Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue |
| • NADMO | National Disaster Management Organisation |
| • NPC | National Project Coordinator |
| • NPP | National Plantation programme |
| • NTFP | Non Timber Forestry Produce |
| • PA | Project Assistant |
| • TIDD | Timber Industry Development Division |
| • VPA | Voluntary Partnership Agreement |

Proceedings	Action																																								
<p>1.0 Opening The meeting started at 11:15 am with a prayer by Mr Emit Ohene Djan, FSD personnel.</p> <p>2.0 Introductions The PA introduced the project team including those to carry out the livelihood survey to the participants. The participants also took turns to introduce themselves, mentioning their names, the stakeholder they represent and the towns or communities.</p> <p>2.1 Introduction of the New CFW The NPC took the opportunity to introduce Mr Charles Nketiah, the new CFW to the participants. Mr Charles Nketiah replaces Mrs Rebecca Baning Oppan who is on transfer to Kumasi.</p> <p>3.0 Purpose of the Meeting The CFW outlined the purpose of the meeting as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. To discuss strategies to address the weaknesses and threats of the 3 options as emerged from the SWOT analysis. ii. To seek the choice of options based on stakeholder ship iii. To carry out livelihood and perception surveys <p>4.0 Reading and Acceptance of the Previous Minutes The previous minutes were distributed to the participants. The PA read the minutes. Some corrections were made on the names and places of some participants. Nana Ofose Kwabi III, a traditional ruler of Otwereso moved for the acceptance of the minutes and seconded by Kwame Attafuah, a lumber dealer as the true reflection of the previous meeting.</p> <p>5.0 Feedback from National MSD 3 Nana Owusu Aduamoah III, a traditional ruler and member of the MSD Steering Committee narrated what transpired at the national MSD 3.</p> <p>6.0 Choice of Option based on Stakeholdership The NPC explained to the stakeholders that the essence of the exercise is to find out which is the most preferred option by each stakeholder group. Therefore the decision should be free of consultations-secret. The result is as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="154 1499 1266 1827"> <thead> <tr> <th>Stakeholder</th> <th>No</th> <th>Option 1</th> <th>Option 2</th> <th>Option 3</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>FC/FSD</td> <td>6</td> <td>1/6=17%</td> <td>4/6=67%</td> <td>1/6=17%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Civil Society</td> <td>1</td> <td>0/1=0%</td> <td>1/1=100%</td> <td>0/1=0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Traditional Authority</td> <td>2</td> <td>0/2=0%</td> <td>2/2=100%</td> <td>0/2=0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Chainsaw Stakeholders Related</td> <td>17</td> <td>1/17=6%</td> <td>8/17=47%</td> <td>8/17=47%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Government Institution</td> <td>7</td> <td>0/7=0%</td> <td>5/7=71.5%</td> <td>2/7=28.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Law Enforcers</td> <td>4</td> <td>0/4=0%</td> <td>3/4=75%</td> <td>1/4=25%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>37</td> <td>2/37=5.4%</td> <td>23/37=62.2%</td> <td>12/37=32.4%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Stakeholder	No	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	FC/FSD	6	1/6=17%	4/6=67%	1/6=17%	Civil Society	1	0/1=0%	1/1=100%	0/1=0%	Traditional Authority	2	0/2=0%	2/2=100%	0/2=0%	Chainsaw Stakeholders Related	17	1/17=6%	8/17=47%	8/17=47%	Government Institution	7	0/7=0%	5/7=71.5%	2/7=28.5%	Law Enforcers	4	0/4=0%	3/4=75%	1/4=25%	Total	37	2/37=5.4%	23/37=62.2%	12/37=32.4%	
Stakeholder	No	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3																																					
FC/FSD	6	1/6=17%	4/6=67%	1/6=17%																																					
Civil Society	1	0/1=0%	1/1=100%	0/1=0%																																					
Traditional Authority	2	0/2=0%	2/2=100%	0/2=0%																																					
Chainsaw Stakeholders Related	17	1/17=6%	8/17=47%	8/17=47%																																					
Government Institution	7	0/7=0%	5/7=71.5%	2/7=28.5%																																					
Law Enforcers	4	0/4=0%	3/4=75%	1/4=25%																																					
Total	37	2/37=5.4%	23/37=62.2%	12/37=32.4%																																					

7.0 Group Discussions and Presentations

Members went into 3 groups to discuss strategies to address the weaknesses and threats of the three options as identified in the SWOT analysis during MSD 2. The rapporteurs presented their groups' outcome.(Detail in annex)

8.0 Livelihood Survey

The livelihood survey team took turn to explain the rationale for the survey and collected their information.

9.0 Closing

The CFW on behalf of the project thanked all participants for attending the meeting.

Meeting ended at 4:15 pm.



Signed:
Charles Nketiah (Chairman)



Signed:
Emmanuel Fosu (Recorder)

Annex

**Option 1: Sawmillers only to Supply Domestic Lumber
Weakness and Threats with Strategies to address them**

Weakness	Strategy
High operational cost leading to high lumber prices.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace old machines with new and more energy efficient ones as way of reducing cost of production. • Hire skilled labour to man the equipment and machinery in order to reduce damage.
Unhealthy competition among sawmills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Involve community forestry committees and traditional authorities when allocating concessions to sawmillers. • FC to ensure fairness and award concessions on merit without favouring one Sawmiller against the other.
Inadequate financial resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmills should create good rapport with banks and financial institutions in order to attract loans.
Lack of technology to operate in difficult terrains. Example valleys and hilly areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sponsor research institutions to research and device technologies that can log in valleys and hilly areas. • Sponsor personnel abroad to study how logging in those areas is done for replication in Ghana.
High environmental impact including crop damage.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental assessment should be carried out by VPA to measure the extent of damage the operation will cost and the necessary compensations paid to the rightful losers before logging is carried out.
Difficulties in supplying local communities due to limited number of sawmills in the local communities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC/FSD should make it a requirement for Sawmillers to establish vibrant market to ensure communities have access to lumber before allocation of concession.
Poor managerial skill	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The industry can identify and recommend a body to train her members in modern managerial skills for affordable fees. • Sawmills should engage qualified personnel to manage their businesses and be ready to pay competitive remuneration.
Waste due to selective logging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Stringent monitoring of logging in the forest by specially trained personnel.
Strong desire to export than to supply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Award of specific hectares of concession should go with specific tons of lumber supply to the domestic market which should be strictly monitored.
Threat	Strategy
Dwindling resource base	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The FC/FSD should encourage tree planting and re-forestation and backed by strong legislation. • The law on tree ownership in individual and family lands and benefit sharing be reviewed to favour individuals to encourage maintenance and tree planting.
Low pricing in the local market	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC, the industry and other bodies which are expert in price determination can come out with regulated range of prices for various lumber sizes for all lumber dealers.
Influx of mushroom sawmills to produce low quality product	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There should be higher standards/criteria to be met before sawmills are recognized and given concessions. The products should be checked regularly.

Fire outbreaks in the forests and workplaces.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should create fire belts around concession areas. • Education of activities which are likely to spark off fire and how to avoid them.
Difficulty in operating in undulating areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Industry can sit with government to allow the use of helicopters to pull timber.
Illegal chainsaw milling in concessions and associated conflicts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should form concession guards to protect their concessions. • Sawmillers should collaborate with CFCs and traditional authorities to help in the protection of their concessions.
Unwillingness of rural communities to cooperate with sawmillers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should interact frequently with the communities to create cordial relationship. • Sawmillers should be responsive to their social responsibility agreement.
High taxation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plead with the government to reduce tax on lumber equipment.
Problems with resource allocation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FC should be transparent in allocating concessions.
Unsustainable supply of utility services. E.g. electricity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sawmillers should procure their own plants to produce electricity.

Option 2 – Sawmills and Artisanal Millers to Supply Domestic Lumber
Weakness and Threats with potential strategies to address them

<i>Weakness</i>	<i>Strategy</i>
Community unit committees and other monitoring bodies are not functional due to lack of resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unit committee members must be adequately resourced and paid monthly for work done. • Sub committee for natural resources/forest must be formed to monitor community forests.
National data capturing system is weak.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All FC/FSD offices furnished with computer and internet facilities to smoothen data collection and management.
Difficulty in monitoring the operations of the two parties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All activities by the two parties should be subjected by approval of the FC/FSD. ▪ Unit committees and traditional rulers should be motivated and given authority to monitor the two parties.
Use of obsolete machinery on the part of sawmillers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The industry should encourage members to use modern and more efficient equipment. ▪ The FC/FSD should make sawmillers and Artisanal millers pay the right charges for all services and that will compel them to go for modern and efficient machines and equipment.
Conflicts between artisanal and saw millers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There should be standing mediation body made up of FC/FSD, industry, artisanal millers, unit committee and traditional authority to mediate conflicts.
The blend may lead to corrupt practices.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There should be stiffer punishment for offenders.
Most artisanal millers use human beings to convey lumber to accessible places	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ They should be encouraged to use cost effective machines and equipment as a requirement for

which can be very risky.	recognition and allocation of concession.
Illegal logging	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ If all loggers including sawmillers and artisanal millers are given permit, they will assist the FC/FSD to prevent illegal logging. ▪ Mass education on the consequences of illegal logging.
<i>Threat</i>	<i>Strategy</i>
Depletion of timber resource	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC/FSD should educate the general public on the use of lumber substitutes. ▪ Tree planting and afforestation.
Loss of jobs by some operators who cannot afford the improved technology.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Encourage the big sawmillers to absorb those operators who may fall out as a result of the improved technology. ▪ Research into viable alternative source of livelihoods.
Difficulty in monitoring the two parties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All activities by the two parties should be subjected by approval of the FC/FSD. ▪ Unit committees and traditional rulers should be motivated and given authority to monitor the two parties.
National data capturing system is weak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All FC/FSD offices should be networked to a central point and among all regional and district offices for easy access to information.
Likely fall in profit as a result of oversupply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The two bodies can form amalgamation to regulate the supply to avoid glut on the domestic market.
Potential differences in prices of lumber.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Establishment of price control systems by a recognized price control board formed by the two bodies.
High cost of equipments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Government should subsidise the cost of forest equipment. ▪ Reduce tax on importation of forest equipment.
Potential problems with utility services.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Institutions should settle their bills promptly. ▪ Institutions should try to procure facilities which will enable them provide some of these utilities by themselves.
Interference by traditional authorities and farmers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The law should be strictly enforced without respect to any individual or institution.

Option 3: Artisanal Operators only to Supply Domestic Lumber
Weaknesses and Threats and Strategies to address them

Weakness	Strategy
Improved operations imply extra cost to artisanal millers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Artisanal millers should form associations so as to be able to solicit for loans. ▪ Members should create cordial relationships with banks in order to be able to access loans to enhance operations.
Poor managerial skills of artisanal operators constitute a weakness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The FC should organise management trainings for artisanal millers to improve their managerial skills.
Legalising artisanal milling may affect the rate at which the forest is diminishing.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC/FSD should encourage them to cultivate their own plantations and also embark on afforestation after logging.
Increased conflict and competition between sawmillers and artisanal millers on forest resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC/FSD should be fair in concession allocation (resources distribution) to avoid conflict.
Lack of technical know-how to operate the improved technology equipment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Artisanal millers should be taken through training sessions as to how the logosol and the wood mizers are used.
Artisanal millers do not compensate farmers adequately.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There should be fix prices for compensations and flexible modalities to follow.
Potential abuse of permit issued by FC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC should institute and met out stiffer sanctions to persons or organisations that abuse the permit.
Artisanal millers do not have the capacity to supply to the domestic market.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Government should reduce tax on timber machinery and subsidise the cost so that artisanal millers can afford to improve their capacity to supply domestic lumber.
Threat	Strategy
Dwindling of the forest resource leading to competition with saw millers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Concession should be awarded on merit, devoid of all corrupt practices.
Ineffective monitoring mechanisms.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ FC should employ more personnel to assist in monitoring. ▪ FC to review her monitoring systems to make it more effective and efficient.
High operational cost due to taxation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Appeal to the government give tax rebate to artisanal millers.
Inability to acquire artisanal equipment/mills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Artisanal millers to form cooperatives to procure mills.
Extreme weather conditions affecting production and forest health.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Very little could be done about this threat.
Lack of transparency in resource allocation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There should fairness in resources allocation to avoid illegality in the sector.
Weak law enforcement in the country.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Law enforcers should be motivated and paid living wages so that there will not be the temptation of bribery.