

**“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”**

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

**Multi Stakeholder Dialogue Two Minutes**

**(MSD 2)**

**Date: 11<sup>th</sup> December, 2009**



The logo for the EU Chainsaw Project is centered around a large, five-pointed yellow star. In the top left corner of the star is the flag of the European Union. In the top right corner is the logo for Tropenbos International Ghana, which features a green tree silhouette over a globe. In the center of the star, the text "EU Chainsaw Project" is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font. Below this text, the logo for the Forestry Commission (AFC) is displayed, consisting of a green tree silhouette and the letters "AFC" in green, with "Forestry Commission" written below. In the bottom left corner of the star is the logo for the Forestry Training Centre (FTC), which features a green tree silhouette and the text "FORESTRY TRAINING CENTRE D/S". In the bottom right corner of the star is the logo for the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) Ghana, which is a circular emblem with a red border and the text "COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC AND INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH" and "GHANA" around the perimeter, with "CSIR" and "FORIG" in the center. At the bottom of the star, the text "IWOKRAMA" is written in a green, stylized font. Below the star, the text "This project is financed by the European Union" is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font.

*By James Parker Mckeown, Mercy Owusu Ansah & Emmanuel Fosu*

## **Acronyms**

CBAG	Community Biodiversity Advisory Group
CFC	Community Forestry Committee
CFW	Community Forestry Worker
CSM	Chainsaw Milling
DFF	District Forest Forum
DOLTA	Domestic Lumber Traders Association
MOFA	Ministry of Food and Agriculture
EU	European Union
FAWAG	Furniture and Wood Workers Association of Ghana
FC	Forestry Commission
FSD	Forest Service Division
PAC	Project Advisory Committee
PMT	Project Management Team
GREDA	Ghana Real Estate Developers Association
GTA	Ghana Timber Association
GTMO	Ghana Timber Millers Association
KNUST	Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology
MSD	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
MSD-SC	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue Steering Committee
MLNR	Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources
NF/CFA	National Facilitator/Community Forestry Advisor
NFA	Community Forestry Advisor
WWAG	Wood Workers Association of Ghana
NFF	National Forest Forum
NPC	National Project Coordinator
PD	Programme Director
RMSC	Resource Management Support Centre
SC	Steering Committee
TBI	Tropenbos International
TIDD	Timber Industry Development Division
VPA	Voluntary Partnership Agreement
WWF	World Wildlife Fund

## **MSD Members Present:**

1. Ekuia Ansah-Eshon	MSD-SC Chairperson
2. Nana Adu Ofori	CBAG, National President, Apapam
3. Stephen A. Sarkodie	Farmer, Juaso District
4. Isaac Kwao	NTFP collector, Akyem Oda
5. Attah Attakey Louis	Lumber Broker, Accra
6. Gabriel Tettevi	Lumber Broker, Ho
7. Francis K. Asiedu	FDA, Begoro District
8. E. Kofi Ametepe	MOFA, Kade
9. O.B. Puplampu	NFF, Koforidua
10. Togbe Kasa III	NFF, Volta Region
11. Osabarima Ofosu Kwabi III	Traditional Authority, Akyem Oda
12. Charles K. Kumi	NFF, Sunyani
13. Solomon Bagaseh	NFF, Upper East Region
14. Donkor Bossman	Chainsaw Operator, Atronie
15. Emmanuel Boafo	CFC, Akyem Oda

16.Sampson Oduro	Sawmiller, Tekyinman
17.Atta Yeboah	NFF, Brong Ahafo Region
18.Kusi Appiah	Carpenter, Assin Foso
19.A. A Nkrumah	NFF, Western Region
20.Amoako Dankwa	Carrier, Juaso
21.Emmanuel Torsu	Chainsaw Operator, Juaso
22.Anthony Haidamous	John Bittar Company, Takoradi
23.Ignituous Amponsah	Lumber Broker, Oda
24.Charles Mensah	Chainsaw Operator, Tekyinman
25.Paul Kpai Yao	NFF, Volta Region
26.Kwame Ofori Attah	Chainsaw Operator, Begoro
27.Victor K. Nyadi	DOLTA,Ashaiman
28.John Arko Tettey	District Assembly, Juaso
29.Daniel Y. Ansah	Lumber Broker, Assin Foso
30.Stephen K. Boafo	Chainsaw Operator, Assin Foso
31.Daniel C. Tecka	Wood Workers Association of Ghana, Kumasi
32.Isaac Anobil	Chainsaw Operator, Akyem Kade
33.Kofi Ampah	Lumber Broker, Nkawkaw
34.Mike Puplampu	GREDA, Accra
35.Bawah Seidu	NFF, Upper West Region
36.R. Agyenim Boateng	Chainsaw Operators, Goaso
37.J.K Tawiah	CFC, Brong Ahafo Region
38.Prince Henneh Ofori	Farmer, Sunyani
39.Alex Dadzie	GTA, Takoradi
35. Francis Nana Akowuah	FAWAG, Kumasi
40.John Amankwah-Okrah	Lumber Broker, Techiman
41.Valerie Fumey Nassah (Mrs)	RMSC, Kumasi
42.Ben Bawa Karimu	NFF, Northern Region
43.Joseph Blay	Judicial Service, Assin Foso
44.Anokye Prince	KNUST, Kumasi
45.Alex Asare	RMSC/NFF, Kumasi
46.Nana Atakora Kodua	NFF, Kumasi
47.Nene Tei D. Korabor IV	Traditional Authority/NFF, Greater Accra Region
48.K.E.Haizel	TIDD, Takoradi
49.Augustine Gyedu	FSD District Manager, Bekwae Ashanti
50.Joseph Boakye	FSD Operations Manager, Accra
51.Richard Kumake	Sawmiller, Juaso
52.Dickson Adjei Sakyi	FSD, Sunyani
53.Susana Karikari	Lumber Broker, Sokoban Wood Village, Kumasi

#### **In Attendance**

1. Prof. Rene Boot	Director, Tropenbos International
2. D.F. Korsah Brown	PAC Member
3. Dr Emmanuel Marfo	PMT member
4. Edward Obiaw	Director, RMSC of FC, Kumasi
5. Samuel Nketiah	PD, TBI Ghana
6. Douglas Asamany	Executive Director, TIDD of FC, Takoradi

#### **Observers**

1. Rebecca B. Oppan	CFW, Akyem Oda
---------------------	----------------

- |                          |                   |
|--------------------------|-------------------|
| 2. Ben Opoku Asare       | CFW, Begoro       |
| 3. Otu Acheampong        | CFW, Goaso        |
| 4. Koranteng William     | CFW, Kade         |
| 5. Seth Duodu            | CFW, Assin Foso   |
| 6. Kow Quaison           | CFW, Sunyani      |
| 7. Owusu Boakye Isaac    | CFW, Juaso        |
| 8. Ernestina Osei        | FORIG, Kumasi     |
| 9. Daniel Forson         | FORIG, Kumasi     |
| 10. Anthony P. Asare     | DOLTA, Ashaiman   |
| 11. Evans Mensah Sampene | TBI Ghana, Kumasi |

### **Project Secretariat**

- |                      |                                    |
|----------------------|------------------------------------|
| 1. James Parker      | NPC, EU Chainsaw Project           |
| 2. Mercy Owusu Ansah | NF/CFA, EU Chainsaw Project        |
| 3. Emmanuel Fosu     | PA, EU Chainsaw Project (Recorder) |

### **Apology**

- |                              |  |
|------------------------------|--|
| 1. K. Acquah Moses           | GTMO – Travelled abroad                            |
| 2. Mr. Joseph Osiakwan       | MLNR - Engagement with minister                    |
| 3. Dr. Beatrice Obiri Darko  | FORIG – Travelled abroad(Argentina)                |
| 4. Alex Boadu                | FC(Operations Director) – Engagement with Minister |
| 5. Prof. Alfred Oteng Yeboah | PAC(Chairman) - Bereaved                           |

### **Absent:**

- |                           |                               |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Dr C.Antwi Boasiako    | KNUST, Kumasi                 |
| 2. Glen Asomaning         | WWF                           |
| 3. Representative         | Forest Watch                  |
| 4. George A. Mathias      | Sawmiller, Begoro(Nkawkaw)    |
| 5. Alhaji Haruna A. Salam | District Assembly, Goaso      |
| 6. Dr Richard Gyimah      | VPA                           |
| 7. Nana Kustamanko        | Traditional Authority, Nkawie |

### **Recorders**

- |                   |                   |
|-------------------|-------------------|
| 1. Paul Osei Tutu | TBI Ghana, Kumasi |
| 2. Jane Aggrey    | TBI Ghana, Kumasi |

### **Agenda:**

The following were agreed for discussion at the meeting:

- Opening
- Introductions
- Inauguration of steering committee
- Welcome Address by steering committee chairperson and TBI Director
- Setting ground rules(code of conduct) for MSD meetings
- Purpose and objective of MSD 2
- Reading of Previous minutes(MSD 1)
- Definition of current problem and development of common aspired future
- Presentation of options
- Introduction to SWOT Analysis and formation of groups
- Break
- Group discussions
- Group presentations

- Evaluation
- AOB
- Date for next meeting
- Closure

Proceedings	Action
<p><b>1.0 Opening</b> The meeting was called to order at about 10.00 a.m. by the NF/CFA after a prayer by Mr. Anthony P Asare.</p> <p><b>2.0 Introduction of Stakeholders and Chairperson</b> The NF/CFA introduced stakeholder groups present, the MSD steering committee, a representative of the PAC, Director of TBI and finally the Chairperson (Ms Ekua Ansah-Eshon) for the meeting. She welcomed all and urged members to effectively participate in the discussion to find a lasting solution to the chainsaw menace.</p> <p><b>2.1 Apologies</b> The NF/CFA announced the following apologies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ Mr. Acquah Moses (GTMO)-out of the country;</li> <li>✓ Mr. Joseph Osiakwan (MLNR)-On National assignment with the minister of LNR</li> <li>✓ Mr. Alex Boadu (FC)-On National assignment with the minister of LNR</li> <li>✓ Prof. Alfred Oteng Yeboah (PAC, Chairman)-Bereaved</li> <li>✓ Dr. Beatrice Darko Obiri (FORIG)-Travelled outside Ghana</li> </ul> <p><b>3.0 Inauguration of Steering Committee</b> Mr. D.F.Korsah Brown, a representative of the PAC inaugurated the Seven-member MSD steering committee. In his inaugural address, he expressed concern about the fast rate at which Ghana's forest is being depleted as a result of illegal logging and other activities. He said the MSD is a good process to address the issues because the MSD process ensures that all stakeholders' interests are considered in any decision to address the problem. He asked members to be less stringent on rules and technicalities, because over reliance on these could slow down progress. He advise members to be guided by the purpose/objectives of the MSD to reach consensus on the way forward in solving the CSM problem.</p> <p><b>4.0 Speeches</b> <b>4.1 Acceptance Speech</b> In her acceptance speech, the chairperson said the issue of illegal CSM in the face of current climate change is worrying. Through the MSD process, stakeholders now have the obligation to reverse the menace of forest resources depletion to that of sustainable forest management. On behalf of the MSD-SC members she thanked stakeholders for selecting them to serve on the SC and also thank the SC members for selecting her to be their chairperson. She pledged to do all she can to ensure an effective MSD process and find a viable solution to the CSM problem. She finally appealed to all stakeholders to put aside their interest for the sake Ghana's forestry and participate effectively in the MSD and also ensure that feedback are sent to and from their constituencies.</p>	<p>All stakeholders</p>

<p><b>4.2 Speech by TBI Director</b>  On behalf of TBI, the Director welcomed the MSD members. He congratulated them for working together with the project team for the past two years. He said two things were vital: the need to understand the problem/issues and how to find a lasting solution to the problem. He entreated participants to put aside their interest and bring on board their knowledge and skills to weigh the pros and cons of each option in order to come out with the best for the country.</p> <p><b>4.3 Speech by TIDD Director</b>  He thanked the project for the opportunity to make a short address and said the use of MSD process to find a viable solution to the illegal CSM problem is a laudable one. It will not only solve illegal CSM problem but also ensure supply of legal lumber for the domestic market which is a requirement for the VPA process. He explained that high domestic demand for lumber and lack of job opportunities are major factors that fuel illegal CSM. He cautioned that any agreed option should not overlook addressing these two factors. He concluded by entreating MSD members to respect each other's view and contribution.</p> <p><b>5.0 Setting of Ground Rules/code of conducts</b>  The NF/CFA led stakeholders to set ground rules for the MSD platform. Members agreed on the following ground rules to guide MSD meetings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ All mobile phones should be switched off or put in vibration/silence mode during meetings</li> <li>✓ Members should respect the view of each other during discussions</li> <li>✓ Verbal assault will not be tolerated during discussion</li> <li>✓ Members should address the chair when making a statement</li> <li>✓ There should be no unauthorized meetings within the MSD meetings</li> <li>✓ Facilitators should keep to time when leading discussions</li> <li>✓ Only MSD members shall participate in discussions and take decisions.</li> </ul> <p>Members agreed that other issues concerning the code should be discussed and finalize by the SC and brought to MSD 3 for agreement.</p> <p><b>6.0 Purpose of the meeting</b>  In presenting the purpose of the meeting, the PD of TBI Ghana, congratulated the MSD-SC members and informed the meeting that the sector ministry has endorsed the MSD process and are waiting for the outcome to feed into the policy review process that is ongoing. He challenged members to effectively contribute to consensus building to help get the right and workable policies in place for addressing illegal CSM in Ghana. He urged members to feel free to speak their minds. He finally presented the purpose of the meeting as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ To develop a guide or code of conduct for MSD meetings</li> <li>✓ To define the current problem and develop a common aspired future</li> <li>✓ To subject the three recommended options to SWOT Analysis</li> </ul> <p><b>7.0 Reading and Acceptance of Previous(MSD 1) Minutes</b>  The chairperson led members through the MSD 1 minutes and after some few corrections and clarifications, Mr Charles Kwesi Kumi moved for the acceptance of the minutes. This was seconded by Nana Adu Ofori .</p>	<p>All stakeholders</p> <p>MSD-SC</p>
--	---------------------------------------

## **7.1 Matters Arising from Previous Meeting**

### **Distribution of Research findings and other documents**

The NPC informed members that both soft and hard copies of the research findings on CSM in Ghana has been sent to GTMO and GTA upon their request during MSD1. Also hard copies of summary report (CSM in Ghana, An overview of the issues) were distributed to all stakeholders who attended the district level meetings. He also informed members that FORIG is working on an abridged version of the report (CSM in Ghana context, drivers and impacts) which will be ready early next year. This will be distributed to all stakeholders on the MSD platform. He explained that report on the findings by the TIDD research has not been finalized and can therefore not be distributed to stakeholders.

### **MSD plan**

Members were informed by the NPC that the MSD plan has been prepared and updated twice. Since it is a “living” document, it will be updated continuously when the need arise. He said copies will be sent to stakeholders by the end of December 2009.

### **Composition of the SC**

In response to a question by Prince Henneh Ofori (a farmer), on why a farmer's is not represented on the MSD-SC, Dr E. Marfo and the NPC explained that the SC's mandate is basically to support planning and management of the MSD meetings and other related activities. They are not the final decision making body of the MSD. There is therefore no need that all key stakeholders are represented on the SC. They concluded that this issue was discussed and agreed during the preparatory and MSD 1 meetings.

## **8.0 Definition of Current Problem and Development of a Common Aspired Future**

The Director of RMSC of FC led the discussion on defining the current problem and developing a common aspired future. The current problems were defined as follows:

- ✓ High domestic demand for lumber
- ✓ Outmoded and unrealistic policy and laws on CSM
- ✓ High illegalities and unsustainable CSM
- ✓ High level of Conflicts
- ✓ Loss of revenue to government and resource owners
- ✓ Forest degradation

Members agreed on the following common aspired future:

- ✓ A reviewed law/policy that conforms to current realities
- ✓ A transformed CSM into acceptable and efficient forest dependent enterprise
- ✓ Adequate and accessible legal lumber on the domestic market
- ✓ Sustainable managed forest
- ✓ Increased revenue to government and resource owners

## **9.0 Presentation of Options**

In his presentation on the recommended options, Dr Marfo explained the events/activities that led to the development of the options and said they were formulated based on the following realities:

NPC

- ✓ Domestic timber needs must be met from legal supply if chainsaw milling 'problem' can be addressed
- ✓ Any policy must deal with two important suppliers, sawmills and chainsaw operators; (either they share the market or one is eliminated)
- ✓ Forest resources are dwindling and all timber production must be within sustainable levels

He then outlined the options as follows:

- ✓ Only sawmills to supply legal lumber to the domestic market. This means maintaining the status quo with strict enforcement.
- ✓ Artisanal operators and sawmills to supply legal lumber to the domestic (50/50).
- ✓ Only artisanal operators to supply legal lumber to the domestic market while sawmillers concentrate on export.

He concluded that the MSD is to discuss and analyse these options and agree on a viable policy direction for supplying legal lumber to the domestic market.

**10.0 Introduction of SWOT analysis and Formation of Groups**

The MSD-SC Vice Chairperson introduced members to SWOT (Strength, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats) analysis. He explained practically how SWOT analysis is done. After some questions and clarifications, members were put into six groups. Two groups analysed one option.

**11.0 Outcome of Group Work on Analysis of option**

Prior to the group discussions, members were asked to select their stakeholder group's preferred option. Eleven people (20% of MSD members) selected option 1 (Sawmillers only supplying domestic lumber), 24 people (44% of MSD members) selected option 2 (Sawmillers and artisanal operators supplying domestic lumber) while 20 people (36% of MSD members) selected option 3 (Artisanal operators only supplying domestic lumber). The meeting could not finish the discussions on the SWOT analysis and agreed to continue with the discussions during MSD3. The detailed preliminary outcome of the SWOT analysis is attached to the minutes.


**Date for next Meeting**

The next meeting was scheduled for the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter of 2010. The date and venue will be decided by the steering committee.

**Closing**

The NF/CFA thanked members for attending the meeting and closed the meeting with a short prayer at 4:00 p.m.

MSD-SC

Signed:   
Emmanuel Fosu(PA) – Recorder

Signed:   
Ms Ekua Ansah Eshon(Chairperson)