

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

Multi Stakeholder Dialogue Minutes

(MSD 1)

Date: 25th September, 2009



By James Parker Mckeown, Mercy Owusu-Ansah & Emmanuel Fosu

Acronyms

CFW	Community Forestry Worker
DFF	District Forest Forum
FAWAG	Furniture and Wood Workers Association of Ghana
FC	Forestry Commission
FSD	Forest Service Division
GTA	Ghana Timber Association
GTMO	Ghana Timber Millers Association
KNUST	Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology
MSD	Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue
MLNR	Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources
NF/CFA	National Facilitator/Community Forestry Advisor
NFA	Community Forestry Advisor
NFF	National Forest Forum
NPC	National Project Coordinator
RMSC	Resource Management Support Centre
VPA	Voluntary Partnership Agreement
WWF	World Wildlife Forum

MSD Members Present:

1. Afori Bruce
National Forest Forum, Central Region
2. Nana Adu Ofori
CBAG, National President, Apapam
3. Stephen A. Sarkodie
Farmer, Juaso District
4. Isaac Kwao
NTFP collector, Akyem Oda
5. Attah Attakey Louis
Lumber Broker, Accra
6. Gabriel Atetteri
Lumber Broker, Ho
7. Francis Assiedu
FDA, Begoro District
8. E. Kofi Ametepe
MOFA, Kade
9. O. B. Puplampu
ERFF, Koforidua
10. Victor K. Nyani
DOLTA, Ashaiman
11. Charles K. Kumi
National Forest Forum, Sunyani
12. Solomon Bagaseh
National Forest Forum, Upper East Region
13. Donkor Bossman
Chainsaw Operator, Atronie
14. Emmanuel Boafo
Community Forest Committee, Akyem Oda
15. Atta Yeboah
National Forest Forum, Brong Ahafo Region
16. A. A Nkrumah
National Forest Forum, Western Region
17. Amoako Dankwa
Carrier, Juaso
18. Emmanuel Torsu
Chainsaw Operator, Juaso
19. W O II Opoku J
Ghana Army, Sunyani
20. Paul Kpai Yao
National Forest Forum, Volta Region
21. Bempong Kwakye
Chainsaw Operator, Begoro
22. John Arko Tettey
District Assembly, Juaso
23. Daniel Y. Ansah
Lumber Broker, Assin Foso
24. Stephen K. Boafo
Chainsaw Operator, Assin Foso
25. Isaac Anobil
Chainsaw Operator, Akyem Kade
26. Mike Puplampu
Ghana Real Estate Developers Association, Accra
27. Alhaji Haruna A. Salam
District Assembly, Goaso
28. Bawah Seidu
National Forest Forum, Upper West Region
29. R. Agyenim Boateng
Chainsaw Operators, Goaso
30. J. K Tawiah
Community Forestry Committee, Brong Ahafo Region
31. Prince Henneh Ofori
Farmer, Sunyani
32. John Amankwah-Okrah
Lumber Broker, Techiman
33. Valerie Fumey Nassah (Mrs)
Resource Management Support Center, Kumasi
34. Ben Bawa Karimu
National Forest Forum, Northern Region
35. Joseph Blay
Judicial Service, Assin Foso
36. Anokye Prince
KNUST, Kumasi
37. Richard Kumake
Sawmiller, Juaso
38. Nana Atakora Kodua
National Forest Forum, Kumasi
39. George A. Matthias
Sawmiller, Begoro (Nkawkaw)
40. Nen Tei D. Korabor IV
Traditional Authority/NFF, Greater Accra Region
41. K. E. Haizel
TIDD, Takoradi
42. Edward Obiaw
RMSC Director (Chairman), Kumasi
43. Augustine Gyedu
FSD District Manager, Bekwae Ashanti
44. Joseph Boakye
FSD Operations Manager, Accra
45. William Baah
FSD Regional Manager, Sunyani
46. Mercy Owusu Ansah
NF/CFA, EU Chainsaw Project
47. James Parker
NPC, EU Chainsaw
48. Emmanuel Fosu
PA/Recorder
49. Susuana Karikari
Lumber Broker, Sokoban Wood Village

Observers

- | | |
|------------------------|-----------------|
| 1. Rebecca B. Oppan | CFW, Akyem Oda |
| 2. Ben Opoku Asare | CFW, Begoro |
| 3. Otuo Acheampong | CFW, Goaso |
| 4. Koranteng William | CFW, Kade |
| 5. Seth Duodu | CFW, Assin Foso |
| 6. Kow Quaison | CFW, Sunyani |
| 7. Owusu Boakyi Isaac | CFW, Juaso |
| 8. Sintim Yabbey Isaac | CFW, Nkawie |
| 9. Edith Abroquah | FC, Kumasi |
| 10. Alex Boadu | FC, Accra |
| 11. Verry Schaafsna | Student |

Apology

- | | |
|-----------------------------|--|
| 1. K. Acquah Moses | Ghana Timber Millers Organization (GTMO) |
| 2. Alex Dadzie | Ghana Timber Association (GTA) |
| 3. Alex Asare | RMSC |
| 4. Sebastian Houwelling | Timber Industry(John Bitar) |
| 5. Nana Kustamanko | Traditional Authority, Nkawie – Sent by Asantehene |
| 6. Mr. Joseph Osiakwan | MLNR |
| 7. Dr. Beatrice Obiri Darko | FORIG |
| 8. Dr. Richard Gyimah | VPA |

Absent:

- | | |
|-------------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Dr C. Antwi Boasiako | KNUST, Kumasi |
| 2. Ekuah Ansah-Eshon | NF, Western Region |
| 3. Glen Asomaning | WWF |
| 4. Representative | Forest Watch |
| 5. Francis Nana Akowuah | FAWAG, Kumasi |

Agenda:

The agreed agenda for the meeting are:

- Opening
- Introduction
- Purpose of the meeting
- Proposed MSD Plan
- Outcome of Meeting with NFF executives on integration
- Listing the prioritizing issues for further MSD discussions
- Management Team
- Venue, date and agenda for MSD 2
- AOB

Proceedings	Action
<p>1.0 Opening The Chairman called the meeting to order at 2:15pm, after a short prayer by one of the MSD members.</p> <p>2.0 Introduction The chairman introduced the facilitators for the meeting after which each MSD member including the observers made self introduction stating their names, stakeholder group they represent and district/region they come from.</p> <p>3.0 Apologies The Chairman announced the apologies from Mr. Alex Dadzie and Mr. Acquah Moses representing GTA and GTMO respectively. The chairman said they informed him they cannot contribute effectively to the discussions since they did not receive the research reports and the options to discuss with their members prior to the meeting. Mr. Alex Asare of RMSC, Mr. Joseph Osiakwan of the MLNR, Dr Richard Gyimah of VPA and Mr. Sebastian Houwelling from the timber industry were out of the country, Nana Kustamanko was on duty for the Asantehene, while Dr. Beatrice Obiri Darko of FORIG asked permission to travel back to Kumasi. On the apologies of Mr. Alex Dadzie and Mr. Acquah Moses, the NPC explained that because the report has not been finalized, it has not been given to any stakeholder. He promised the secretariat will send the drafts to the GTA and GTMO and address their concerns before MSD 2 meeting.</p> <p>4.0 Purpose of the meeting The NF/CFA explained that, the MSD is one of the core activities of the project which also addresses the domestic market issues under VPA and therefore members are expected to effectively participate in discussing the issues of illegal chainsaw milling and come out with viable option(s) to address the problem. He further explained the objectives and agenda of the meeting and spelt-out the expected outputs as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • finalized the structure of the MSD, • list and priorities issues to be discussed, • identify gaps for further research (action research), • form the MSD steering committee and • agree on date and agenda for the MSD 2. <p>Mr. Prince A. Anokye, Ben B. Karimu and Bawah Seidu suggested that the meeting defer prioritization of the issues to MSD 2 to enable members thoroughly study the research findings and prioritise them well. They argued that since it is the first time most members had been informed about the research findings, some time is needed to digest the issues and prioritize to soundly discuss the illegal chainsaw problem. The suggestion was accepted.</p> <p>5.0 Proposed MSD plan The NF/CFA outlined the MSD plan and the outputs. She said, in all, 9 MSDs will be organised from 2009 to 2011. The ultimate aim is to propose policy options for addressing illegal chainsaw and ensure that domestic market is supplied with legal lumber as stipulated in the VPA and develop an action plan to implement preferred options. She also explained that other activities such as capacity building, communicating outcome to the</p>	<p>Project Secretariat</p> <p>Project Secretariat</p> <p>All MSD members</p>

wider stakeholders and action research would be undertaken with the MSD members. The management of the MSD will be supported by a steering committee which will be created today. She concluded by urging all stakeholders to look at the national interest first and discuss the issues dispassionately and come up with suitable options to address the problem of illegal chainsaw milling. After some discussions, comments and clarification on the plan, it was agreed that the plan should serve as a guide and must allow changes when necessary. It should be updated periodically.

For the sake of members, who were not present at the preparatory meeting in February 2009, the NPC briefed members about the key outcomes. He explained the agreed form and structure of the MSD, number of members, methods to be adopted in discussing issues, how to ensure commitment and ownership, feedback mechanism, how to communicate outcome to policy makers and strategies for managing conflicts. He also explained why the steering committee could not be created at the preparatory meeting.

6.0 Outcome of meeting with the NFF executives on Integration

The NF/CFA explained the importance of integrating the MSD into the NFF. She informed members that prior to the meeting with the NFF executives, preliminary meetings were held with RMSC who is facilitating the NFF and the NFF executives on the intention of the project to integrate the MSD into the NFF at the initial stage. She said based on these meetings, a draft form and structure, scope, how to manage conflicts, feedback mechanism and number of NFF members to be added to the MSD was prepared and discussed with the NFF executives. Some of the key outcome of the meeting are as follows:

- Since the MSD has already some members of the forest forum, 12 additional forum members will be added to the MSD;
- MSD meeting discussions will cover chainsaw milling and related issues
- In the project districts where DFF's have not been established, the district level MSD will eventually become the district forest forums;
- Members of the MSD may also attend the regional forest forums;
- National and district level MSD members will be involved in dissemination of information/options to policy makers and their constituencies/communities;
- The NFF will be represented in the MSD management team.
- An MoU will be signed between the MSD and the NFF on the integration

The NF/CFA concluded that report covering the outcome of the meeting is available and will be sent to members before MSD 2

Identification of issues for further MSD discussion

Three groups were formed to identify key issues based on the research findings that would be discussed further at the MSD platform and inform recommended options. After some time of discussions, the following issues were identified :

1. Demand and supply of lumber to the domestic market

- ✓ Local demand and overland export
- ✓ Characteristic of the local market
- ✓ Alternatives to substitute lumber
- ✓ Importing timber for processing
- ✓ Alternatives to supplying legal lumber to the domestic market

Secretariat

2. Sustainability of resource

- ✓ Annual Allowable cut exceeds current resource base of 1,600,000 hectares
- ✓ Dwindling resource base
- ✓ Forest plantation/afforestation
- ✓ Developing alternatives like bamboo/rattan plantation
- ✓ Developing lesser known species
- ✓ Impact of logging/chainsaw milling on environment

3. Policy/law/ institutional issues

- ✓ Assessment of Failure/success of policy/law banning chainsaw milling
- ✓ Interpretation of "legal and illegal" as related to lumber production
- ✓ Tree ownership and tenure
- ✓ Sharing of benefits from tree resources
- ✓ Access to timber resources by local people
- ✓ Capacity of FC to manage chainsaw milling
- ✓ VPA process

4. Alternative livelihoods

- ✓ Viable alternative livelihoods
- ✓ VPA and implication on livelihoods
- ✓ Chainsaw milling as a viable forest base enterprise

5. Research Issues

- ✓ Analysis of implications of recommended options
- ✓ Economic cost benefit analysis of recommended options.

6. Improved Technology

- ✓ Formation of cooperative to use improved technology
- ✓ Improved chainsaw (logosol/wood miser) to take over supply of lumber to the domestic market

7. Others

- ✓ Corruption
- ✓ Political will/ interferences
- ✓ Level of conflicts
- ✓ Revenue loss to the state and local people
- ✓ Public awareness creation on chainsaw issues
- ✓ Improving the technology of chainsaw milling
- ✓ Design Monitoring systems

Options

- Sawmills to supply the domestic market with legal timber obtained from sustained yields
- Sawmills and other players to supply the domestic market with legal timber obtained from sustained yields.
- Artisanal improved mills to supply all lumber required by the domestic market while sawmills focus on export, within sustained yields.

Nominations and Selection of MSD Management Team Members

The NPC briefed the participants on the need to form the MSD management team to

oversee and manage the MSD platform. The MSD management team will support the project (secretariat) in the management and coordination of the MSD. This calls for the nomination of person with high level of commitment and an in-depth knowledge of forestry/chainsaw issues who will be able to help in the effective and efficient management of the MSD process. The following persons were finally nominated to form the seven-member MSD management team:

- Mr Alex Asare – RMSC
- Ms Akua Ansah-Eshon – Forest Forum
- Mr Prince A. Aboagye – KNUST
- Mr Richard Agyenim Boateng – Chainsaw Operator
- Nana Owusu Aduamoah III – Traditional Authority
- Mr Augustine Gyedu – FSD
- Naa Robert Loggah-Forest Forum


Date for Second MSD Meeting

Participants agreed to 20th November, 2009 as the date for the second MSD meeting.

Closing

The Facilitators thanked all participants for their patience and time for going through all the two programmes successfully, particularly, for their wonderful contributions. He assured the participants of the project's commitment to ensuring that, their time and other resources spent on the project's meetings will yield positive result in future. The NPC also thanked all participants for their participation.

The meeting ended at 6:24 pm.

Signed 
Emmanuel Fosu(PA) – Recorder

Signed 
Mr. Edward Obiaw (Chairman)