

Final draft

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

First District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue (DMSD 1) Minutes Begoro

Date: 27th October, 2009
Venue: FSD Conference Hall



The logo for the EU Chainsaw Project is centered around a large, five-pointed yellow star. At the top left of the star is the flag of the European Union. At the top right is the logo for Tropenbos International Ghana, which features a green tree and the text 'TROPENBOS INTERNATIONAL' and 'GHANA'. In the center of the star, the text 'EU Chainsaw Project' is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font. Below this text are four logos: the Forestry Commission logo (a green tree and the text 'AFC Forestry Commission'), the Iwokrama logo (a globe and the text 'IWOKRAMA'), the Forestry Training Centre logo (a green circle with a white sunburst and the text 'FORESTRY TRAINING CENTRE D/CS'), and the CSIR logo (a red circle with a blue gear and the text 'CSIR COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC AND INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH - GHANA - HONORARY FORIG'). At the bottom of the star, the text 'This project is financed by the European Union' is written in a bold, blue, sans-serif font.

Members Present

1. Ben Opoku Asare	FSD,CFW
2. Nana Adu Ofori	CBAG, Kyebi Apapam
3. Bempong Kwakye	Chainsaw Operator, Begoro
4. Dina Gyima	Farmer, Ahwenease
5. Kwabena Kusi	NTFP collector, Kyebi Apapam
6. Thomas Anyang	Carpenter, Kyebi Apapam
7. Thomas Owusu	Carpenter, Akwanserem
8. Alex Afoakwah	Farmer, Akwanserem
9. Dzandu S.K.	Chainsaw operator, Nkakama
10. Kwame Atta Ofori	Machine Owner, Ahomahomaso
11. Siame Stanley	Machine Owner, Feyiase
12. Margaret Amponsah	Farmer, Feyiase
13. Nana Kyei Boatey	Farmer, Begoro
14. Joseph Amfo Antwi	Sawmiller, Begoro
15. A. A. Bempong	Carpenter, Begoro
16. S. H. Amenyio	Carpenter, Begoro
17. D. Y. Benefo Antwi	Carpenter, Begoro
18. K.N.Adjabeng	Farmer, Hemang
19. P.E.Azidoku	MOFA, Begoro
20. Isaac Gyekye	FSD, Begoro
21. Owusu Daniel	Chainsaw Operator, Pano
22. Inspector Amo Mensah	Ghana Police Service, Begoro
23. Charles	Chainsaw Operator, Begoro
24. Samuel Doh	FSD, Begoro
25. Isaac Danquah	Farmer, Kibi

Apology:

- | | | |
|-------------------------|------|---|
| 1. Mr. Emmanuel Yeboah | FSD, | DM – Attended meeting in Koforidua |
| 2. The Planning Officer | | FDA – On official duties outside the district |

Absent

- | | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. The Representative | BNI |
| 2. The Representative | Traditional Authority |

Agenda:

The following items were agreed to be discussed at the meeting:

- Opening
- Introductions
- Objective of meeting
- Presentation of research findings
- Outcome of first MSD minutes and prioritization of issues
- Feedback on MSD 1 and research findings
- Nomination of district MSD management team members
- AOB

Acronyms

• BNI	Bureau for National Investigation
• CBAG	Community Biodiversity Advisory Group
• CBUD	Centre for Biodiversity and Utilization Development
• CFW	Community Forestry Worker
• CSM	Chainsaw Milling
• DFF	District Forest Forum
• DM	District Manager
• DLMSD	District Level Multi-stakeholder Dialogue
• FC	Forestry Commission
• FDA	Fantiakwa District Assembly
• FSD	Forestry Services Division
• MOFA	Ministry of Food and Agriculture
• MSD	Multi-stakeholder Dialogue
• NTFP	Non Timber Forestry Produce
• NPC	National Project Coordinator
• PA	Project Assistant
• VPA	Voluntary Partnership Agreement
• TIDD	Timber Industry Development Division
• BNI	Bureau of National Investigation

Proceedings	Action
<p>1.0 Opening The CFW of Begoro District called the meeting to order at 10:20 am. After Mr. A. A. Bempong had prayed. The CFW apologized for the change in venue for the meeting from the FDA’s conference hall to the district FC’s office and explained that the original venue was booked for other activity.</p> <p>2.0 Introductions The CFW introduced the team from the project secretariat after which each DLMSD member made self introduction stating their names, stakeholder group they represent and the community they are coming from.</p> <p>3.0 Apologies The CFW announced the apologies from Mr. Emmanuel Yeboah (FSD District Manager) and the district Assembly representative who were out of the district for official duties.</p> <p>4.0 Objectives of the meeting The NPC outlined the purpose of the meeting which includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dissemination of the research findings and the three options • Feedback from the national MSD 1 meeting and receive inputs into the MSD 2 meeting • Identify and prioritize district and community level concerns and issues that need 	

further discussion

- Select district level MSD management team

5.0 Presentation and discussion of research findings

The NPC presented the research findings. The presentation focused on the following areas:

- Evolution of CSM in Ghana
- The policy and legal aspects of CSM in Ghana
- Why the law has been ineffective
- Drivers of CSM
- CSM and the domestic market
- The impacts of CSM (social, economic and environmental)
- Potential loss to the state
- Beneficiaries of chainsaw revenue
- Recovery efficiencies of the various technologies for sawing lumber
- The three options as emerged from the Technical Committee meeting
- Way forward

The NPC added that, TIDD of FC also conducted a research on domestic wood supply and demand situation in Ghana and the findings are almost the same as that of the chainsaw project. This he stressed authenticates the findings and offers credible information to rely on for discussion and finding lasting solutions to the illegal CSM menace.

Finally he urged the members to restrict their questions and contributions to solving problems based on the research findings.

5.1 Questions and Contributions (Feedback)

The following were some of the questions and contributions from the participants:

- **Chainsaw Operator:** It is clear from the findings that the ban on CSM has failed to yield anticipated results and the free hand milling technology is not efficient. The timber resources are also being depleting at an alarming rate, but CSM provides enormous economic opportunities to many rural people. I think the way forward is for the government to legalize the operations and put measures in place to ensure that improved technologies like logosol and wood miser are used with strict supervision for compliance.
- **Chainsaw Operator:** The finding shows that our activities have contributed immensely to the destruction most of the forest. We the operators are prepared to help replant the degraded forest and I suggest the authorities should come up with a program so that we can come in and help.
- **Farmer:** I wish to thank the presenter and the project for the sound information presented. It is really sad to hear that our forest cover has reduced to such a level due to some greedy and selfish individuals. I wish to suggest that if possible the FC and the project such disseminate this finding as wide as possible so that stakeholders will appreciate the harm being caused to the nation and put all interest aside to find a lasting solution to the CSM problem

- **CBAG rep:** For me I think option two (both the industry and other players should supply the domestic market with lumber) will be the best and we should look at government giving out the off-reserves to organized and improved chainsaw operation where activities is well regulated and the operator made to replant the forest. A lesson can be learnt from how the local gin distillation is now organized and where members of the cooperatives regulate their own activities. The reserves can be given to the regular timber industry since they are already organized. They should also be made to plant back the forest where they operate.
- **Chainsaw Operator:** I don't agree with the findings that chainsaw operation is the major cause of forest depletion. I think slash-and-burn agriculture, bush fires and charcoal burning destroy the forest more than CSM.
- **Carpenter:** As a carpenter, all that I need is lumber for my work. In this district, the only source of lumber is from CSM. The industry export all what they produce. Ten years of implementing the ban is long enough to attest that it will not work. The government and FC should be bold to review the law, by making sure that lumber is available on the domestic market even if it means banning export.
- **Sawmiller:** One of the issues we should also look at seriously as we discuss the CSM problem is benefit sharing. Because a lot of farmers are not benefiting from the trees on their farms and so they either kill plants at the young stage or illegally sell the trees to chainsaw operators. Farmers will do aggressive tree planting or leave naturally germinating tree to grow if they know they will benefit when the trees mature.
- **Machine Owner:** This is the first time I am hearing of VPA. I don't know how many of us understand what it is. From the explanation, I see it as a good agreement, but we need to know more about it especially its impacts on our livelihood. It is very important that the FC embark on a vigorous education on the VPA to ensure its success.
- **Carrier:** I wish to thank the project for the research. It has really made me understand benefits and consequences of CSM and also the status of our forest. I think this will enable us to really discuss the issues and come out with a viable option to address the problem. I will advise all stakeholders to put aside their interest and think about the forest.
- **NTFP Collector:** Farmers living in forest fringed communities are also to be blame for the forest degradation. They encroach on the forest reserves. I will urge the FC/FSD to link with agricultural officers in the districts to educate the farmers on improved farming methods so that they don't destroy the forest further.
- **MOFA Officer:** This district in the past was noted for food crops cultivation. Today, the situation is different; this is due the destruction of forest caused by bushfires and chainsaw operations. The chainsaw operator should know that, their activities in the short term may seem beneficial to them, but in the long term will affect national food security. MOFA has initiated a number of agricultural programmes which the chainsaw operators and other stakeholders can be part and benefit immensely. I will urge the chainsaw operators and other stakeholders to organize themselves into groups so they can benefit from these initiatives.
- **Chainsaw Operator:** How can we organize ourselves into groups to be part of government initiative when we have been branded; thieves, armed robbers nation wreckers etc. Because of this we cannot register as a group and benefit from credit

schemes to stop CSM.

Response:

The NPC thanked contributors for their feedback. He said the feedback will feed into discussions at the national MSD meetings. He assured stakeholders that the project will do what it can and within its means to disseminate the findings to stakeholders and as widely as possible. A communication strategy will guide the dissemination drive.

In response to some of the suggestion and question, the NPC explained that all stakeholders have contributed in one way or the other in bringing about this problem and there is no need to blame each other now. We have to put aside our differences and look at the issues and come out with options to address them. For now, the ban is still in place and chainsaw operators should respect the ban until the issues are addressed. The project will assist in organizing stakeholders into groups so that they can be part of government alternative livelihood initiatives.

On the VPA, the NPC and CFW explained the process again and its possible impact on livelihoods.

The CFW also revealed that the government is putting in place a program for an aggressive nationwide afforestation program. Every year at least 100 hectares of land will be planted in each administrative district. He therefore urged the chainsaw operators and other stakeholders to be part of the program when it takes off so that they can also benefit.

6.0 Outcome of First MSD Meeting

Copies of minutes of the MSD 1 meeting were distributed to stakeholders. The NPC and the CFW briefed the members on the key outcomes of the meeting in Accra.

7.0 Group Discussions and Presentation

Members were put into three groups to discuss issues listed during MSD 1 meeting and prioritize them based on what is prevailing in the district. 12 issues were listed (annex).The following were prioritized:

- Transforming CSM into a viable forest based enterprise
- Cost and benefit analysis of recommended options
- Alternative livelihoods
- Tree planting/afforestation
- Public awareness on research findings

8.0 Selection of DMSD Organizing/management Team

The meeting selected the following persons to assist the CFW to organize and manage DMSD meetings in the district:

- Kwame Ofori Atta – Machine Owner
- Nana Kyei Boatey - Farmer
- Nana Adu Ofori - CBAG

- Bempong Kwakye – Chainsaw Operator
- Margaret Amponsah - Farmer

9.0 AOB

9.1 Feedback from national MSD meeting

The CFW reminded representatives to the DMSD and those to the national MSD that one of their responsibilities is to send feedback to and from the groups they represent. He said the success of the MSD meetings will largely depend on the level of involvement of all the stakeholder and this will also depend on how effective feedbacks are received.

9.2 Alternative livelihood

The representative from the District MOFA office listed a number of initiatives being undertaken by the agricultural sector and others available in the district. He asked the project to link up with the MOFA office to discuss how stakeholders could benefit from the agro-based initiatives. It was agreed that alternative livelihood options should be part of the discussion during the next DMSD meeting.

9.3 Integration of DMSD into DFF

The NPC informed the meeting that the district MSD will be integrated into the existing DFF where forestry issues in general will be discussed (including CSM).

10.0 Next Meeting

The date for the next meeting will be scheduled by the district MSD management.

11.0 Closing

The CFW on behalf of the project thanked all participants for attending and urged them to send feedback of proceedings to their communities and stakeholder groups.

Meeting ended at 3:40 pm.

Signed: 
James Parker Mckeown(NPC)

Signed: 
Emmanuel Fosu(Recorder)

Annex 1**Issues listed at DMSD meetings –Begoro**

No.	Issues listed	Groups that listed the issue	Remarks
1	Creating public awareness on the research findings	1,3	Priority
2	Reviving/formation of CFCs in forest fringe communities	1	Low priority
3	Tree planting/afforestation	1,2,3	High Priority
4	Benefit sharing	1	Low priority
5	Local demand and overland export	1	Low priority
6	Alternative livelihoods	1,2,3	High priority
7	Capacity of FC to implement new policy	1	Low priority
8	Transforming CSM into a viable forest based enterprise	1,2,3	High priority
9	Cost and benefit analysis of recommended options	1,3	Priority
10	Efficiency in the use of timber resources	3	Low priority
11	Corruption	3	Low priority
13	Interpretation of laws/policies regarding trees and CSM	3	Low priority