

Final draft

“Developing alternatives for illegal chainsaw lumbering through multi-stakeholder dialogue in Ghana and Guyana”

European Commission programme on Tropical Forests and other Forests in Developing Countries

First District Level Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue (DMSD 1) Minutes Assin Foso

Date: 22nd October, 2009
Venue: Municipal Assembly Hall



EU Chainsaw Project



This project is financed by the European Union

Present

- | | |
|---------------------------|------------------------------------|
| 1. Anthony K. Deyegbe | MOFA, Assin Foso (B) |
| 2. Cromwell T Adikah | MOFA, Assin Foso (A) |
| 3. Daniel B. Amankrah | Carpenter, Assin Foso |
| 4. S.K Boafo | Chainsaw Operator, Assin Foso |
| 5. Kyei Kwadwo | Operator, Assin Foso |
| 6. Daniel Y.Ansah | Wood Dealer, Assin Foso |
| 7. Nana Ampomah Kubrah IV | Traditional Authority, Assin Manso |
| 8. Yaw Barimah | Traditional Authority, Assin Manso |
| 9. Nana Amoako Gyampah II | Traditional Authority, Assin Juaso |
| 10. Francis Ayisi | Carpenter, Assn Foso |
| 11. Patrick Danso | NADMO/Forest Forum, Assin Foso |
| 12. Nana Kwabena Anti | Traditional Authority |
| 13. Kwadwo Tweneboah | Farmer, ASSIN MANSO |
| 14. Gerald Sackey | ANMA, Assin Foso |
| 15. Emmanuel A.Acquaye | MOFA, Twifo Praso |
| 16. Mustapha Salifu | Transporter, Assin Foso |
| 17. Yaw Yeboah | Carrier, Twifo Praso |
| 18. Atta Escobar | Carrier, Twifo Praso |
| 19. Charles Donkor | Carrier, Assin Foso |
| 20. Joseph Blay | Magistrate, Assin Foso |
| 21. Ajah Donkor | Wood dealer, Assin Foso |
| 22. Nii Adjah Sai | BNI, Assin Foso |
| 23. Charles Koomson | Operator, Twifo Praso |
| 24. Hon Samuel Oppong | Assemblyman, Twifo Praso |
| 25. Joseph B. Danquah | Wood dealer, Twifo Praso |
| 26. Kweasigah Emmanuel | Wood dealer, Twifo Praso |
| 27. Robert A. Obeng | MOFA, Assin South |
| 28. Paul Acquah | District Assembly, Twifo Praso |

In attendance

- | | |
|---------------------|---------------------|
| 1. I.C.Y Ametorgbor | DFM, FSD Assin Foso |
|---------------------|---------------------|

Project Secretariat

- | | |
|-------------------|---------------------|
| 1. James Parker | NPC, EU-CSM Project |
| 2. Seth Duodu | CFW, EU-CSM project |
| 3. Emmanuel Fosu | PA, EU-CSM project |
| 4. Enerstina Osei | Intern FORIG |

Agenda:

The following items were agreed to be discussed at the meeting:

- Opening
- Introductions
- Objective of meeting
- Presentation of research findings and options

- Outcome of first MSD meeting
- Discussions on the issues listed during MSD1
- Selection of DMAD Organizing/management team
- AOB

Acronyms

- ANMA Assin North Municipal Assembly
- BNI Bureau of National Investigation
- CFW Community Forestry Worker
- CSM Chainsaw Milling
- FSD Forestry Services Division
- DFM District Forestry Manager
- DMSD District Multi-stakeholder Dialogue
- EU European Union
- FC Forestry Commission
- FSD Forestry Services
- MOFA Ministry of Food and Agriculture
- NADMO National Disaster Management Organization
- NTFP Non Timber Forestry Produce
- NPC National Project Coordinator
- TA Traditional Authority
- TIDD Timber Industry Development Division
- PA Project Assistant
- VPA Voluntary Partnership Agreement

Proceedings	Action
<p>1.0 Opening The CFW called the meeting to order at 10: 15 a.m. after a prayer by Mr. Kwadwo Tweneboah. He then welcomed all participants to the meeting.</p> <p>2.0 Introductions The CFW asked all participants to make self introduction stating their names, stakeholder group they represent and the community they are coming from.</p> <p>2.1 Welcome address by the DFM The DFM explained the relationship between illegal CSM and forest degradation and outlined measures that were put in place in the past. He said after 10 years, the measures have done little to address the problems. It is time to take stock and agree on a viable option. He lauded the MSD approach by the project and asked all stakeholders to effectively participate in MSD meetings to find a lasting solution to the illegal CSM problem.</p> <p>3.0 Objectives of the Meeting The NPC outlined the purpose of the meeting as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dissemination of the research findings and the three options 	

- Feedback from the national MSD 1 meeting and receive inputs into the MSD 2 meeting
- Identify and prioritize district and community level concerns and issues that needs further discussion
- Select district level MSD management team

4.0 Presentation of Research Finding and option

The NPC presented the research findings covering the following areas:

- Evolution of CSM in Ghana
- The policy and legal aspects of CSM in Ghana
- Measures put in place to address CSM
- Why the law has been ineffective
- Drivers of CSM
- CSM and the domestic market
- The impacts of CSM (social, economic and environmental)
- Potential loss to the state
- Beneficiaries of chainsaw revenue
- Recovery efficiencies of the various technologies for sawing lumber
- The three options as emerged from the Technical Committee meeting
- Way forward

The NPC also briefed the meeting on the outcomes of the regional workshop and the preceding technical committee meeting. He said the regional workshop provided an opportunity to share lessons and experiences with representatives from Kenya, Liberia, Nigeria, Uganda, Cameroun, DR Congo and Guyana. The NPC added that, TIDD of FC also conducted a research on domestic wood supply and demand situation in Ghana and the findings are almost the same as that of the chainsaw project. This he stressed authenticates the findings and offers credible information to rely on for discussion and finding lasting solutions to the illegal CSM menace. He finally urged members to ask questions and make inputs that will help find a lasting solution to the illegal CSM problems in the country.

4.1 Questions and Contributions

The following were some of the questions and contributions from the participants:

- **Chainsaw Operator:** Chainsaw operation nowadays is very risky and many of us would have wished to stop this practice, but there are no viable job opportunities in the rural areas. Any option should seriously look at viable alternative and I believe many of us will live this risky job.
- **Farmer:** The only source of lumber for construction in our area is chain sawn lumber. Even if there are sawmill in the district capital, it will cost us a lot to buy and convey lumber to our communities. I recommend that in solving the CSM problems, the government should ensure that there is lumber which is also affordable in the rural areas.
- **Traditional authority:** It is clear from the presentation that CSM has its good side and one of them is providing job opportunities for people in both the rural and urban areas. It is also clear that that the financiers take the larger part of the revenue and the

chainsaw operators face the highest risk. Can't we adopt lessons from Nigeria, Uganda etc. where they have been able to transform CSM into a viable forest based enterprise for our chainsaw operators to benefit and also eliminate lost of revenue to government?

- **Farmer:** It is sad to see and hear that our forest is being degraded at such alarming rate. In the past sawmills/loggers were required to plant back trees they fell. But now I am told they pay for that. If that is true, why is it that the FC is not using the money to plant back the forest? If they are planting, I would be glad if they could show us where they are planting.

Response (FC): Yes its true concessioners pay for re-planting trees they have taken and we have been re-planting the trees over the years. The FC has a plantation development division which is in charge of this. The plantation activities have not had the desired impact because the rate of deforestation far exceeds the re-planting efforts due to CSM activities. Early next we will launch a massive tree planting programme and we hope all of you will play your part to restore back our forest.

- **Farmer:** I will blame the government for what is happening. If the government has ban CSM and willing to enforce ban, why should they allow importation of the chainsaw machines into the country without control?

Response (Magistrate): Chainsaw machines are not only used for illegal CSM. Sawmillers and concessioner use them to log trees, farmers use them to clear their farms for cultivation etc. and therefore I don't think there is the need to ban or control its importation. For instance acquisition of gun does not warrant sporadic shootings and killings. We need to address why the laws are not being enforced. For now, the law specifically forbids the use of chainsaw machine for converting timber to lumber for commercial purpose and anyone who flouts the law should be prosecuted.

- **Agriculturist (MOFA):** Based on the research findings, I would like to advise the chainsaw operators that the future of their job is bleak and it's important that they look for viable alternative livelihoods and invest in the monies they have accrued over the year. The MOFA has a number of agro-based initiatives which they can take advantage and be part. There are also some alternative livelihood initiatives by the district assembly.

- **Farmer:** Tree tenure and benefit sharing should be looked at critically in any option discussions. At the moment we don't benefit from any royalty and we either kill the trees while young or illegally sell them to the chainsaw operators. If we know we will benefit in future, we will nurture more trees. We can also help in the re-afforestation programme if things are made clear and the laws reformed to benefit us.

- **Carrier:** Why is it that when it comes to forest degradation, everybody is laying the blame on CSM and not others such as wildfire, slash-and-burn-agriculture, charcoal burning and NTFP collectors?

Response (NPC): Yes it's true that those activities also contribute to the degradation of our forests and the FC and other stakeholders are also addressing that under other initiatives. We are talking about CSM because that is what our action is focusing.

5.0 Outcome of First MSD Meeting

Copies of minutes of the first national MSD meeting were distributed to stakeholders.

Representatives who attended the national MSD meeting, the CFW and the NPC presented

outcomes of the meeting to the stakeholders.

6.0 Group Discussions

Stakeholders were put into 3 groups to discuss issues listed during MSD 1 meeting and prioritize them based on conditions prevailing in the district. 13 issues were listed (annex) and the following were given high priority:

- Tree planting/afforestation
- Alternative livelihoods
- Transforming CSM into viable forest based enterprise

7.0 Nomination of District MSD Management Team

Stakeholders agreed that the following persons should assist the CFW to organize and manage the DMSD meetings :

- Emmanuel Acquaye – MOFA, Twifo Praso
- S.K Boafo - Chainsaw Operator, Assin Foso
- Daniel Ansah – Wood Dealer, Assin Foso
- Patrick Danso – NADMO/Forest Forum, Twifo Praso

8.0 AOB

8.1 Need for Feedback

The CFW and NPC advised representatives to the national MSD and DMSD meetings to send outcomes of meetings to their constituencies/group/communities they represent and feedback to the MSDs. He explained that the MSD is the mechanism adopted to discuss and come to a consensus on viable options to address the illegal CSM problem. They said for an effective MSDs stakeholders must participate effectively at all levels and they can do that by receiving outcomes and also sending feedbacks.

8.2 Alternative Livelihood

The district MOFA representative advised chainsaw operators and other stakeholders especially those who depend on CSM, to consider venturing into agriculture as a viable alternative livelihood. He said from the presentation it is clear that CSM does not have future if they operators continue with their current rate of operations. Cultivation of crops like pepper, cabbage and other vegetables are less risky and requires very little capital, but the returns are good.

8.3 Integration of DMSD into DFF

The NPC informed stakeholders that the district MSD will be integrated into the existing DFF where forestry issues in general will be discussed (including CSM issues). Where there are no DFF, the DMSD will be established as DFF.

9.0 Next Meeting

The date for the next meeting will be scheduled by the district MSD management.

10.0 Closing

The CFW on behalf of the project thanked all participants for attending and urged them to send outcomes to their groups/constituencies/communities.

Mr S.K.Boafo moved for closure of meeting and was seconded by Yaw Barimah.

Meeting ended at 3:20 pm.

Signed:

James Parker Mckeown (NPC)



Signed:

Emmanuel Fosu (Recorder)



Issues listed at DMSD meeting-Assin Foso

No.	Issues listed	Groups that listed the issue	Remarks
1	Creating public awareness on the research findings	3	Low priority
2	Tree planting/afforestation	1,2,3	High Priority
3	Tree ownership and tenure and Benefit sharing	2,3	Priority
4	Local demand and overland export	2	Low priority
5	Alternative livelihoods	1,2,3	High Priority
6	Transforming CSM into a viable forest based enterprise	1,2,3	High Priority
7	VPA and its implication on livelihoods	1	Low priority
8	Developing alternatives to lumber	2,3	Priority
9	Developing lesser known species	2	Low priority
10	Alternatives to supplying legal timber to the domestic market	1	Low priority
11	Capacity of FC to implement new policy	2,3	Priority
12	Corruption	1,2	Priority
13	Political interference	1,2	Priority